

REFERENCE TO ABSTRACT OBJECTS IN DISCOURSE

by

NICHOLAS ASHER

*Department of Philosophy and
Center for Cognitive Science,
The University of Texas at Austin, U.S.A.*



KLUWER ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS
DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----|
| PREFACE | ix |
| INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| CHAPTER 1 -- FROM EVENTS TO PROPOSITIONS: A TOUR OF ABSTRACT ENTITIES, EVENTUALITIES AND THE NOMINALS THAT DENOTE THEM | 15 |
| 1. Distributional Data and the Typology of Abstract Entities | 18 |
| 1.1 Events and Propositions: The Poles of the Spectrum | 18 |
| 1.2 States and Other Sorts of Eventualities | 23 |
| 1.3 Situations | 24 |
| 1.4 Divisions Among Proposition-like Entities | 26 |
| 2. Quantification, Abstract Object Anaphora and the Typology of Abstract Objects | 32 |
| 2.1 Quantification | 32 |
| 2.2 Anaphora | 34 |
| 3. Principles of Summation and Structured Domains for Abstract Entities | 40 |
| 3.1 Events | 41 |
| 3.2 Propositions | 48 |
| 3.3 States | 51 |
| 3.4 Facts | 55 |
| 4. Provisional Conclusions | 57 |
| CHAPTER 2 -- A CRASH COURSE IN DRT | 63 |
| 1. A Philosophical Overview of the Aims of Discourse Representation Theory | 63 |
| 2. The Basic Fragment | 66 |
| 2.1 DRSs and Truth Conditions | 66 |
| 2.2 The Basic Construction Procedure | 69 |
| 2.3 DRS Construction, Multiple Sentence Discourse, and Intersentential Anaphora | 73 |
| 2.4 Every and if...then | 74 |
| 2.5 SubDRSs, Accessibility, and Anaphora | 75 |
| 2.6 Scopes for Quantifiers in DRT and Other Constraints on Anaphora | 79 |
| 2.7 Other Determiners and Operators in the Basic Fragment | 81 |
| 2.8 External Anchors and Definites | 82 |
| 3. Expanding the Fragment: Events in DRT | 85 |
| 4. Plurals in DRT | 91 |

| | | |
|---|---|------------|
| 4.1 | DRS Construction for Plurals and Basic Plural Anaphora | 91 |
| 4.2 | Plural Anaphora | 92 |
| 5. | Appendix: Formalization of DRS Construction and DRS Interpretation | 95 |
| 5.1 | Definition of DRSS | 95 |
| 5.2 | Model Theory | 96 |
| 5.3 | The Construction Procedure and its Semantics | 98 |
| CHAPTER 3 -- ATTITUDES AND ATTITUDE DESCRIPTIONS | | 111 |
| 1. | Attitudes and Attitude Formation | 111 |
| 2. | Attitudes, Operators, and Predicates | 115 |
| 3. | Interpreting Attitude Ascriptions | 118 |
| 4. | Concepts and Attitudes | 122 |
| 5. | Attitudes, Propositions, and Representations | 128 |
| 6. | Conclusions | 135 |
| CHAPTER 4 -- THE SEMANTIC REPRESENTATION FOR SENTENTIAL NOMINALS | | 138 |
| 1. | Syntactic and Semantic Assumptions and Basic Principles | 141 |
| 1.1 | Assumptions about Syntax and the Syntax-Semantics Interface | 141 |
| 1.2 | Additional Semantic Principles and the Effects of the DP Analysis on DRS Construction | 144 |
| 2. | Derived Nominals | 149 |
| 2.1 | The Distinction between Process and Result Nominals | 150 |
| 2.2 | Process Nominals | 152 |
| 2.3 | Result Nominals | 157 |
| 2.4 | Propositional and Fact Readings of Derived Nominals | 159 |
| 2.5 | Remarks on Property Derived Nominals | 162 |
| 3. | <i>Of-ing</i> Gerund Phrases and Bare Nominals | 163 |
| 3.1 | Analysis of <i>of-ing</i> Gerund Phrases | 163 |
| 3.2 | The Aspectual Force of <i>-ing</i> in <i>Of-ing</i> Gerunds | 167 |
| 3.3 | Bare Gerunds and Nominals | 168 |
| 4. | <i>That</i> Clauses | 171 |
| 4.1 | <i>That</i> Clauses Differ from DPs | 171 |
| 4.2 | N'-CP Constructions | 172 |
| 4.3 | <i>That</i> Clause Constructions, Factive Presuppositions, and Individual Anaphora | 178 |
| 5. | More Abstract Nominals: Infinitivals and Projective Propositions | 180 |
| 5.1 | Analysis of Infinitivals | 180 |
| 5.2 | Chierchia's Analysis of Infinitivals | 184 |
| CHAPTER 5 -- PROBLEMS FOR THE SEMANTICS OF NOMINALS | | 190 |
| 1. | IP Gerunds and Some Data About Them | 190 |
| 2. | The Syntactic and Semantic Analysis of IP Gerunds | 193 |
| 2.1 | ACC- <i>ing</i> Constructions as IPs | 193 |
| 2.2 | POSS- <i>ing</i> Constructions as IPs | 197 |
| 3. | Naked Infinitives | 204 |
| 4. | Correspondences and Connections Between Abstract Objects | 206 |
| 4.1 | The Structure of Abstract Object Domains in Natural Language Metaphysics | 206 |

| | | |
|---|---|------------|
| 4.2 | The Spectra of Nouniness and World Immanence Do Not Correlate Completely | 207 |
| 4.3 | Proposition Readings for Fact Nominals: Shifts up the Spectrum of World Immanence | 207 |
| 4.4. | Predicate Incompatibilities and Polymorphic Characterizing Structures | 210 |
| 4.5 | Metaphysical Relations Between Eventualities and Abstract Objects in Natural Language Metaphysics | 212 |
| 5. | The Problem of Event Negation Solved | 214 |
| 5.1 | Three Tests for Negation and Event Descriptions | 215 |
| 5.2 | Negation Without Wide Scope Adverbials | 217 |
| 5.3 | Negation and Wide Scope Adverbials | 218 |
| 5.4 | Negation and Event Nominals | 219 |
| 6. | Conclusions Concerning DRS Construction for Nominals: Lessons for Natural Language Metaphysics | 221 |
| CHAPTER 6 -- ANAPHORA AND ABSTRACT ENTITIES | | 225 |
| 1. | Toward a Unified Analysis of Abstract Entity Anaphora | 225 |
| 2. | Event Anaphora | 232 |
| 3. | Event-Type Anaphora and Using Event-Types to Construct Event Sums | 235 |
| 4. | Proposition Anaphora | 241 |
| 5. | Fact Anaphora | 245 |
| 6. | Concept Anaphora in DRT | 246 |
| 6.1 | Concept Anaphora with Explicit Anaphors | 246 |
| 6.2 | VP Ellipsis in DR Theory | 251 |
| CHAPTER 7 -- A THEORY OF DISCOURSE STRUCTURE FOR AN ANALYSIS OF ABSTRACT ENTITY ANAPHORA | | 256 |
| 1. | The Problem of Discourse Structure and Anaphora | 258 |
| 2. | Discourse Structure and Discourse Representation Theory | 262 |
| 3. | Discourse Relations and Their Semantics | 263 |
| 4. | Principles of Discourse Segmentation and SDRS Constituent Construction | 269 |
| 4.1 | Constraints on Attachment | 270 |
| 4.2 | Inferring Discourse Relations | 272 |
| 4.3 | Rules for Attachment | 275 |
| 5. | Revision of Constituents after Updating | 284 |
| 6. | Taking Stock | 297 |
| 7. | Appendix of Definitions and Constraints in Chapter 7 | 299 |
| 7.1 | Basic Definitions for SDRSs and Their Constituents | 299 |
| 7.2 | Axioms and Meaning Postulates for Discourse Relations | 300 |
| 7.3 | Basic Definitions and Axioms for SDRS Updating | 302 |
| 7.4 | Constituent Revision | 304 |
| CHAPTER 8 -- APPLYING THE THEORY OF DISCOURSE STRUCTURE TO THE ANAPHORIC PHENOMENA | | 312 |
| 1. | Constraints on Abstract Object Anaphora Derived from an SDRS: Availability and Well-Foundedness | 312 |
| 2. | Some Examples of Proposition Anaphora | 318 |

| | | |
|---|--|------------|
| 3. | Availability, Anaphora and Constituent Revision | 321 |
| 3.1 | Availability and Parallelism and Contrast | 321 |
| 3.2 | Availability and Topic Revision | 330 |
| 3.3 | The Limits of Availability | 338 |
| 4. | Discourse Subordination | 339 |
| 5. | Event and Plural Anaphora Revisited | 345 |
| 6. | Anaphoric Connections Across Different Abstract Types | 349 |
| 7. | Conclusions About Abstract Anaphora | 351 |
| CHAPTER 9 -- APPLICATIONS OF THE THEORY OF DISCOURSE STRUCTURE TO CONCEPT ANAPHORA AND VP ELLIPSIS | | 354 |
| 1. | Extending SDRS Theory | 354 |
| 2. | Examples of Overt Concept Anaphora | 357 |
| 3. | VP Ellipsis | 361 |
| 4. | Sloppy Identity | 370 |
| 5. | Concluding Thoughts on Abstract Entity Anaphora | 381 |
| 6. | Appendix of Definitions and Constraints for Concept Anaphora | 382 |
| CHAPTER 10 -- MODEL THEORY FOR ABSTRACT ENTITIES AND ITS PHILOSOPHICAL IMPLICATIONS | | 387 |
| 1. | First Order or Higher Order DRT? | 388 |
| 2. | Intentional Frames and Intensional Contents | 391 |
| 3. | Problems of Self-Reference | 395 |
| 4. | Two Arguments for a Representational Theory of Abstract Entities | 407 |
| 5. | Metaphysical Representationalism and Metaphysical Reduction | 413 |
| 6. | Technical Appendix | 419 |
| 6.1 | Intentional Frames and Frege Structures | 419 |
| 6.2 | Intensional Contents | 424 |
| 6.3 | The Semantics for the Expanded Construction Procedure | 429 |
| CONCLUSION | | 434 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY | | 436 |
| INDEX | | 451 |