

ELEVENTH EDITION

Critical Thinking, Reading, and Writing

A Brief Guide to Argument

SYLVAN BARNET

HUGO BEDAU

JOHN O'HARA

*Associate Professor of Critical Thinking,
Reading, and Writing, Stockton University*



bedford/st.martin's
Macmillan Learning

Boston | New York

Brief Contents

Preface v

PART ONE CRITICAL THINKING AND READING 1

- 1** CRITICAL THINKING 3
- 2** CRITICAL READING: GETTING STARTED 37
- 3** UNDERSTANDING RHETORICAL APPEALS 75
- 4** IDENTIFYING PROCEDURES IN ARGUMENT 101
- 5** VISUAL RHETORIC: THINKING ABOUT IMAGES AS ARGUMENTS 151

PART TWO CRITICAL WRITING 189

- 6** WRITING AN ANALYSIS OF AN ARGUMENT 191
- 7** DEVELOPING AN ARGUMENT OF YOUR OWN 224
- 8** USING SOURCES 258

PART THREE FURTHER VIEWS ON ARGUMENT 331

- 9** A PHILOSOPHER'S VIEW: THE TOULMIN MODEL 333
- 10** A LOGICIAN'S VIEW: DEDUCTION, INDUCTION, AND FALLACIES 348

11	A PSYCHOLOGIST'S VIEW: ROGERIAN ARGUMENT	384
12	A LITERARY CRITIC'S VIEW: ARGUING ABOUT LITERATURE	395
13	A DEBATER'S VIEW: ORAL PRESENTATIONS AND DEBATE	416

PART FOUR **CURRENT ISSUES AND AN ENDURING QUESTION** **425**

14	ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE: SHOULD WE LET COMPUTERS DECIDE?	427
15	A COLLEGE EDUCATION: WHAT IS ITS PURPOSE?	440
16	HOW AND WHY DO WE CONSTRUCT THE "OTHER"?	456

Text Credits **490**

Index of Authors, Titles, and Terms **493**

Contents

Preface v

PART ONE CRITICAL THINKING AND READING 1

1	CRITICAL THINKING	3
	Thinking about Thinking	4
	Thinking as a Citizen	6
	Obstacles to Critical Thinking	7
	An Essay on Types of Thinking (and Rethinking)	8
	ADAM GRANT, A Preacher, a Prosecutor, a Politician, and a Scientist	8
	An organizational psychologist insists “we need to develop the habit of forming our own second opinions.”	
	Thinking through an Issue	12
	Evaluating a Proposal	13
	Survey, Analyze, and Evaluate the Issue	13
	VISUAL GUIDE: EVALUATING A PROPOSAL	15
	Anticipating Counterarguments	15
	Critical Thinking at Work: From a Cluster to a Short Essay	16
	ALEXA CABRERA, Stirred and Strained: Pastafarians Should Be Allowed to Practice in Prison (student essay)	17
	A student explores the boundaries of religious freedom in state penitentiaries.	
	Generating Ideas: Writing as a Way of Thinking	19
	Confronting Unfamiliar Issues	21

Using Clustering to Discover Ideas	21
Approaching an Issue (or an Assignment)	22
Prompting Yourself: Classical Topics and Invention	23
An Essay for Generating Ideas	24
ASAO B. INOUE, Do Grades Help Students Learn in Classrooms?	24
A writing professor examines the importance of risk-taking while learning: “What if you need to get things wrong in order to learn a new practice or discover new information?”	
THINKING CRITICALLY: GENERATING IDEAS	28
Generating Ideas from Multiple Perspectives	28
A CHECKLIST FOR CRITICAL THINKING	30
A Short Essay Calling for Critical Thinking	31
ANAND JAYPRAKASH VAIDYA, The Inclusion Problem in Critical Thinking: The Case of Indian Philosophy	31
A professor of philosophy examines multiple examples of Indian philosophy to demonstrate the importance of “character view” in critical thinking.	
Assignment for Critical Thinking	36
2 CRITICAL READING: GETTING STARTED	37
Framing Arguments	38
Active Reading	39
Previewing	40
A CHECKLIST FOR PREVIEWING AND SKIMMING	41
A Short Essay for Previewing Practice	44
THINKING CRITICALLY: PREVIEWING	44
CHARLES R. LAWRENCE III, On Racist Speech	45
A law professor suggests that the framing of racist language as a free speech issue “has placed the bigot on the moral high ground and fanned the rising flames of racism.”	
Reading with a Careful Eye: Underlining, Highlighting, Annotating	48
Reading: Fast and Slow	50
Summarizing and Paraphrasing	51
A CHECKLIST FOR A PARAPHRASE	54

Patchwriting and Plagiarism	54
Strategies for Summarizing	56
Critical Summary	58
A Short Essay for Summarizing Practice	60
VISUAL GUIDE: WRITING A CRITICAL SUMMARY	61
SUSAN JACOBY, A First Amendment Junkie	62
A feminist argues against those feminists who seek to ban pornography.	
A CHECKLIST FOR A SUMMARY	65
Essays for Analysis	66
GWEN WILDE, Why the Pledge of Allegiance Should Be Revised	
(<i>student essay</i>)	66
A student concludes that “those who wish to exercise religion are indeed free to do so, but the place to do so is not in a pledge that is required of all schoolchildren and of all new citizens.”	
SOHRAB AHMARI, Porn Isn’t Free Speech — on the Web or Anywhere	69
A journalist argues in favor of obscenity laws that would restrict the access of pornographic content online.	
SUZANNE NOSSEL, The Pro-Free Speech Way to Fight Fake News	71
A leading voice on issues related to freedom of expressions counsels, “The best prescription against the epidemic of fake news is to inoculate consumers by building up their ability to defend themselves.”	
Assignment for Critical Summary	74
3 UNDERSTANDING RHETORICAL APPEALS	75
Argument and Persuasion	76
Persuasive Appeals	76
THINKING CRITICALLY: IDENTIFYING ETHOS	78
VISUAL GUIDE: EVALUATING PERSUASIVE APPEALS	79
Seeing the Appeals in Real-World Events	79
Unethical Uses of Rhetorical Appeals	82
Are Such Appeals Always Unethical?	84
Nonrational Appeals: Satire, Irony, Sarcasm	84

Does All Communication Contain Arguments? 87

THINKING CRITICALLY: EMOTIONAL APPEALS 88

An Example Argument and a Look at the Writer’s Rhetorical Appeals 89

KWAME ANTHONY APPIAH, Go Ahead, Speak for Yourself 89

A cultural theorist and philosopher argues that an understanding and embrace of intersectionality requires that we cut back on “the urge to underwrite our observations with our identities.”

Arguments for Analysis 92

AFRIKA AFENI MILLS, A Letter to White Teachers of My Black Children 92

An educator implores teachers to gain “a much deeper understanding of racial history and ongoing racial matters” to cultivate more equitable learning environments.

DODAI STEWART, The Case for a National One-Week Vacation 96

An editor writes a memo to the United States of America, outlining the benefits of a collective break: “One solid week. No one works. NOTHING happens . . . Full nation vacation!”

JEFFREY T. BROWN, The Yelling of the Lambs 97

Shortly after the Marjory Stoneman Douglas High School shooting in Parkland, Florida, an attorney warns people that anger “is not a basis for good policy.”

Assignment for Rhetorical Analysis 99

4 IDENTIFYING PROCEDURES IN ARGUMENT 101

The Power and Perils of Reason 102

Rationalization 103

Confirmation Bias 104

Types of Reasoning 104

Induction 105

Deduction 105

VISUAL GUIDE: DEDUCTION AND INDUCTION 106

Premises and Syllogisms 106

Testing Truth and Validity 107

A CHECKLIST FOR EVALUATING A SYLLOGISM 110

THINKING CRITICALLY: INDUCTIVE AND DEDUCTIVE REASONING 113

Some Procedures in Argument	114
Definitions	114
THINKING CRITICALLY: ANALYZING DEFINITIONS	118
Evidence	119
THINKING CRITICALLY: AUTHORITATIVE TESTIMONY	125
A CHECKLIST FOR EVALUATING STATISTICAL EVIDENCE	128
Assumptions	129
A CHECKLIST FOR EXAMINING ASSUMPTIONS	130
An Essay for Examining Assumptions	131
ELIZABETH AURA MCCLINTOCK, Should Marriage Still Involve Changing a Woman’s Name?	131
A professor of sociology argues that the practice of women changing their names for marriage is “fundamentally rooted in patriarchal marital traditions” and is “profoundly heterosexist.”	
An Example Argument and a Look at the Writer’s Strategies	134
JOHN TIERNEY, The Reign of Recycling	134
A journalist contends that “the recycling movement is floundering” and has gone beyond its originally good intentions to become an unsustainable and even counter-productive practice.	
Arguments for Analysis	139
JOHN E. FINN, The Constitution Doesn’t Have a Problem with Mask Mandates	139
A professor of government explains that “the protection of all constitutional liberties rides upon certain necessary—but rarely examined—assumptions about communal and public life” in the US Constitution.	
LOREN LAOMINA, 13 Thoughts on Reparations, Afropessimism and White Supremacy	142
A writer and grassroots activist uses logical syllogisms to reflect on current and past events in the United States, explaining that “to be a Black American is to be psychically imperiled by your history.”	
Assignment for Identifying Procedures in Argument	150

5	VISUAL RHETORIC: THINKING ABOUT IMAGES AS ARGUMENTS	151
	Uses of Visual Images	152
	Seeing versus Looking	153
	VISUAL GUIDE: ANALYZING IMAGES	154
	Reading Advertisements	156
	A CHECKLIST FOR ANALYZING IMAGES	159
	Detecting Emotional Appeals in Visual Culture	159
	Reading Photographs	161
	Do Photographs Always Tell the Truth?	163
	A CHECKLIST FOR INSPECTING DIGITAL PHOTOGRAPHS	165
	Are Some Images Not Fit to Be Shown?	166
	A CHECKLIST FOR PUBLISHING CONTROVERSIAL IMAGES	168
	Accommodating, Resisting, and Negotiating the Meaning of Images	168
	Writing about Political Cartoons and Memes	170
	THINKING CRITICALLY: ANALYZING MEMES AND POLITICAL CARTOONS	173
	An Example: A Student’s Essay Analyzing Images	174
	RYAN KWON, <i>The American Pipe Dream?</i> (student essay)	174
	A student analyzes two visual arguments to argue that the “American dream is — and always was — elusive.”	
	Visuals as Aids to Clarity: Maps, Graphs, and Pie Charts	178
	A Word on Misleading or Manipulative Visual Data	178
	A CHECKLIST FOR CHARTS AND GRAPHS	179
	Using Visuals in Your Own Paper	182
	Visual Arguments for Analysis	183
	DOROTHEA LANGE, <i>Migrant Mother</i>	183
	A photographer dramatizes poverty during the Great Depression with iconic photographs of a mother and her children.	

NORA EPHRON, *The Boston Photographs* 184

Arguing against the widespread view that newspapers ought not to print pictures of dead bodies, a columnist, screenwriter, and director suggests that, since “death happens to be one of life’s main events,” it is “irresponsible . . . for newspapers to fail to show it.”

Assignment in Visual Rhetoric 188

PART TWO CRITICAL WRITING 189

6 WRITING AN ANALYSIS OF AN ARGUMENT 191

Analyzing an Argument 192

Examining the Author’s Thesis 192

Examining the Author’s Purpose 193

Examining the Author’s Methods 194

Examining the Author’s Persona 194

Examining the Author’s Audience 195

A CHECKLIST FOR ANALYZING AN AUTHOR’S INTENDED AUDIENCE 198

Organizing Your Analysis 198

VISUAL GUIDE: ORGANIZING YOUR ANALYSIS 199

Summary versus Analysis 200

A CHECKLIST FOR ANALYZING A TEXT 201

An Argument, Its Elements, and a Student’s Analysis of the Argument 201

NICHOLAS D. KRISTOF, *For Environmental Balance, Pick Up a Rifle* 202

“Let’s bring back hunting.”

THINKING CRITICALLY: EXAMINING LANGUAGE TO ANALYZE AN AUTHOR’S ARGUMENT 204

The Essay Analyzed 204

THERESA CARCALDI, *For Sound Argument, Drop the Jokes: How Kristof Falls Short in Convincing His Audience* (student essay) 206

A student conducts a close read of Nicholas D. Kristof’s “For Environmental Balance, Pick Up a Rifle.”

An Analysis of the Student's Analysis 208

A CHECKLIST FOR WRITING AN ANALYSIS OF AN ARGUMENT 209

Arguments for Analysis 210

JENNIFER BARTLETT, Disability and the Right to Choose 210

An essayist and poet uses a powerful narrative to show how “modern medicine could be used to devalue, or even weed out, people with disabilities.”

MATTHEW WALTHER, Sorry, Nerds: Video Games Are Not a Sport 212

A national correspondent contends that “video games are not a sport” on the grounds of definition, in which “a sport involves not only skill and competition but physical exertion and at least the possibility of injury.”

JUSTIN CRONIN, Confessions of a Liberal Gun Owner 214

A lifelong Democrat makes a case for the right to bear arms.

ROXANE GAY, The Price of Black Ambition 217

The author, professor, and social commentator unpacks “the idea that black Americans must make themselves more respectable in order to matter.”

Assignment for Writing an Analysis of an Argument 223

7 DEVELOPING AN ARGUMENT OF YOUR OWN 224

Planning an Argument 225

Getting Ideas: Argument as an Instrument of Inquiry 225

Brainstorming Strategies 226

Revision as Invention 230

The Thesis or Main Point 230

Raising the Stakes of Your Thesis 231

A CHECKLIST FOR A THESIS STATEMENT 232

THINKING CRITICALLY: “WALKING THE TIGHTROPE” 233

Imagining an Audience 234

Addressing Opposition and Establishing Common Ground 235

A CHECKLIST FOR IMAGINING AN AUDIENCE 237

Drafting and Revising an Argument 237

The Title 237

The Opening Paragraphs 238

Organizing the Body of the Essay 241

VISUAL GUIDE: ORGANIZING YOUR ARGUMENT	241
Checking Transitions	243
The Ending	243
THINKING CRITICALLY: USING TRANSITIONS IN ARGUMENT	244
Uses of an Outline	245
A CHECKLIST FOR ORGANIZING AN ARGUMENT	246
Tone and the Writer’s Persona	246
THINKING CRITICALLY: ELIMINATING WE, ONE, AND I	250
A CHECKLIST FOR ESTABLISHING TONE AND PERSONA	250
Avoiding Sexist Language	251

Peer Review **251**

A CHECKLIST FOR PEER REVIEW	252
------------------------------------	------------

A Student’s Essay, from Rough Notes to Final Version **253**

EMILY ANDREWS, Why I Don’t Spare “Spare Change” (<i>student essay</i>)	255
---	------------

A student explains why she “will not attempt to be a mini-charitable organization, distributing spare change likely to go to an unworthy cause.”

Assignment for Developing an Argument of Your Own **257**

8 USING SOURCES **258**

Why Use Sources? **259**

Entering a Discourse	259
Understanding Information Literacy	262

Choosing a Topic **263**

A CHECKLIST FOR APPROACHING A TOPIC	264
--	------------

Finding Sources **265**

Finding Quality Information Online	266
------------------------------------	-----

VISUAL GUIDE: FINDING DISCOURSE ON YOUR TOPIC **267**

Finding Articles Using Library Databases	268
--	-----

THINKING CRITICALLY: USING SEARCH TERMS **271**

Locating Books	272
----------------	-----

Evaluating Sources	272
Scholarly, Popular, and Trade Sources	273
Evaluating Online Sources	276
A CHECKLIST FOR IDENTIFYING RELIABLE WEBSITES	278
A CHECKLIST FOR IDENTIFYING FAKE NEWS	286
Considering How Current Sources Are	287
A CHECKLIST FOR EVALUATING SOURCES	287
Performing Your Own Primary Research	288
Interviewing Peers and Local Authorities	288
Conducting Observations	289
Conducting Surveys	289
Research in Archives and Special Collections	290
Synthesizing Sources	291
Taking Notes	291
A Note on Plagiarizing	292
A CHECKLIST FOR AVOIDING PLAGIARISM	293
Compiling an Annotated Bibliography	294
Quoting from Sources	295
VISUAL GUIDE: INTEGRATING QUOTATIONS	298
THINKING CRITICALLY: USING SIGNAL PHRASES	299
Documentation	299
A Note on Footnotes (and Endnotes)	300
MLA Format: Citations within the Text	300
MLA Format: The List of Works Cited	303
An Annotated Student Research Paper in MLA Format	312
LESLEY TIMMERMAN, An Argument for Corporate Responsibility <i>(student essay)</i>	313
A student argues that “corporations have to take responsibility for their actions, beyond making money for shareholders.”	
APA Format: Citations within the Text	319

APA Format: The List of References	319
A CHECKLIST FOR CRITICAL PAPERS USING SOURCES	324
An Annotated Student Research Paper in APA Format	325
HANNAH SMITH BROOKS, <i>Does Ability Determine Expertise?</i> (<i>student essay</i>)	325
A student promotes the value of “extended and extensive study and exposure” over “inherent ability.”	
Assignment for Using Sources	330

PART THREE FURTHER VIEWS ON ARGUMENT 331

9 A PHILOSOPHER’S VIEW: THE TOULMIN MODEL 333

Understanding the Toulmin Model	334
VISUAL GUIDE: THE TOULMIN METHOD	335
Components of the Toulmin Model	335
The Claim	335
Grounds	336
Warrants	336
Backing	337
Modal Qualifiers	338
Rebuttals	339
THINKING CRITICALLY: CONSTRUCTING A TOULMIN ARGUMENT	340
Putting the Toulmin Method to Work: Responding to an Argument	341
JONATHAN SAFRAN FOER, <i>Show Your Hands: Saving the Planet Begins at Breakfast</i>	341
A novelist and essayist argues that “we cannot keep the kinds of meals we have known and also keep the planet we have known.”	
Thinking with the Toulmin Model	345
A CHECKLIST FOR USING THE TOULMIN METHOD	347

10 A LOGICIAN'S VIEW: DEDUCTION, INDUCTION, AND FALLACIES 348

Using Formal Logic for Critical Thinking 349

Deduction 350

Examples of Deduction 354

Induction 359

Observation and Inference 359

Probability 361

Mill's Methods 363

Fallacies 364

VISUAL GUIDE: COMMON FALLACIES 365

Fallacies of Ambiguity 367

Fallacies of Presumption 368

Fallacies of Irrelevance 372

A CHECKLIST FOR EVALUATING AN ARGUMENT WITH LOGIC 374

Additional Fallacies 375

THINKING CRITICALLY: IDENTIFYING FALLACIES 376

MAX SHULMAN, Love Is a Fallacy 377

A short story about the limits of logic: "Can you give me one logical reason why you should go steady with Petey Bellows?"

11 A PSYCHOLOGIST'S VIEW: ROGERIAN ARGUMENT 384

Rogarian Argument: An Introduction 385

VISUAL GUIDE: ROGERIAN ARGUMENT 386

A CHECKLIST FOR ANALYZING ROGERIAN ARGUMENT 387

CARL R. ROGERS, Communication: Its Blocking and Its Facilitation 387

A psychotherapist explains why we must see things from the other person's point of view.

LEWIS OAKLEY, Is It Time to Retire the Word "Privileged"? 393

An equality activist proposes abandoning the word "privileged" because "no one has ever agreed to change their behavior because someone called them a name."

12 A LITERARY CRITIC'S VIEW: ARGUING ABOUT LITERATURE 395

Why Is Literature Important? 396

Interpreting 396

Judging (or Evaluating) 398

Theorizing 403

A CHECKLIST FOR ARGUING ABOUT LITERATURE 403

Example: A Student Interprets Richard Blanco's "One Today" 404

RICHARD BLANCO, One Today 404

A poet commemorates the perseverance of the United States.

JACKSON DiPIERO, Unity in Times of Division: An Analysis of Richard Blanco's "One Today" (student essay) 407

A student argues that Blanco's "One Today" does not "represent entirely the truth of the nation."

A Short Story for Analysis 413

KATE CHOPIN, The Story of an Hour 413

A short story tells of a woman who has just learned of her husband's death and thinks repeatedly, "Free!" Will the freedom she imagines last?

Thinking about the Effects of Literature 415

13 A DEBATER'S VIEW: ORAL PRESENTATIONS AND DEBATE 416

Oral Presentations 417

Methods of Delivery 419

Audience 420

A CHECKLIST FOR AN ORAL PRESENTATION 420

Delivery 421

Content 422

Formal Debates 422

Standard Debate Format 423

A CHECKLIST FOR PREPARING FOR A DEBATE 424

**14 ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE: SHOULD WE LET COMPUTERS
DECIDE? 427**

**SAFIYA UMOJA NOBLE, Missed Connections: What Search Engines Say
about Women 427**

A professor of gender studies and African American studies examines disturbing search engine results and argues for information results that “don’t prioritize the most explicit, racist or sexist formulations around identity.”

Analyzing a Visual: Predictive Search 433

MARK MANSON, I, for One, Welcome Our AI Overlords 433

A leading technologist predicts the rise of robots “orders of magnitude more intelligent than us” — and why that may not be a bad thing.

15 A COLLEGE EDUCATION: WHAT IS ITS PURPOSE? 440

ANDREW DELBANCO, 3 Reasons College Still Matters 440

An American studies professor defends liberal arts education: “The best chance we have to maintain a functioning democracy is a citizenry that can tell the difference between demagoguery and responsible arguments.”

EDWARD CONARD, We Don’t Need More Humanities Majors 444

An economist with the American Enterprise Institute argues that people with degrees in technical fields are far better at growing the economy than those who get degrees in the humanities, opening the possibility for “fully harnessing America’s talent and putting it to work.”

**CHRISTIAN MADSBJERG AND MIKKEL B. RASMUSSEN, We Need More
Humanities Majors 446**

In response to Conard, the authors — senior partners at a business consulting firm — argue that people with humanities degrees can be invaluable in solving business problems because of their ability to understand customers: “We need humanities majors more now than before to strengthen competitiveness and improve products and services.”

JOHN SAILER, Is Our Obsession with College Fueling a Mental Health Crisis? 449

A research associate for the National Association of Scholars argues that college is not the right choice for everyone and that “public policy could encourage young people to consider options other than college.”

CAROLINE HARPER, HBCUs, Black Women, and STEM Success 452

A political scientist at Howard University argues that diversity in STEM fields could be improved by encouraging disadvantaged and minoritized students to attend Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs), where they can be “welcomed by a nurturing environment that provides critical resources to overcome academic, social, and financial hurdles.”

16 HOW AND WHY DO WE CONSTRUCT THE “OTHER”? 456

JEAN-PAUL SARTRE, Anti-Semite and Jew 456

An existentialist philosopher reasons that “Anti-Semitism, in short, is fear of the human condition.”

HANS MASSAQUOI, Destined to Witness 461

A German African who grew up in Nazi Germany tells of his misguided attempt to join the Hitler Youth as a young boy because “I’m German just like anybody else.”

W. E. B. DU BOIS, Of Our Spiritual Strivings 464

A pioneering sociologist describes his concept of double-consciousness among African Americans: “One ever feels his two-ness, — an American, a Negro; two souls, two thoughts, two unreconciled strivings; two warring ideals in one dark body. . . .”

BRIDGET ANDERSON, The Politics of Pests: Immigration and the Invasive Other 470

A professor of sociology argues that metaphors “are at their most effective when they are surreptitious and uncontested” and discusses the implications of comparing immigrants to pests.

JOHN BARTH, Us/Them 475

A short story writer explores the “us” versus “them” dynamics of a fictional gated community.

JACOB RIIS, How the Other Half Lives (*photographs*) 483

A photographer and social reformer documents abysmal tenement living conditions in late nineteenth-century New York City.

SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR, The Woman as Other 485

A philosopher theorizes the secondary status of women in a dualistic world: “Here is to be found the basic trait of woman: she is the Other. . . .”

RUDYARD KIPLING, *We and They* 486

A poet presents the disparate lives but universal understanding of “we” and “they.”

EMARI DIGIORGIO, *When You Are the Brownest White Girl* 488

A poet reflects on the color of her skin as a weak marker of her cultural identity.

Text Credits 490

Index of Authors, Titles, and Terms 493