

A Proposition for a Multilateral Carbon Tax Treaty

Tatiana Falcão

Thesis
submitted to the Vienna University of
Economics and Business (Wirtschafts Universität Wien)
in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor in Law (Doktorin der Rechtswissenschaften)

Degree awarded on 19 October 2016



Volume 47
IBFD Doctoral Series

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	xiii
Preface	xv
List of Abbreviations	xvii
Chapter 1: Contextualizing the Problem	1
1.1. Executive summary	1
1.2. Book structure	12
1.3. Book outline	13
Chapter 2: Classification of Environmental Taxes	17
2.1. Introduction	17
2.2. The need for a change in paradigm in the design of environmental policy	18
2.2.1. Establishing the instrument to promote the environmental objectives	18
2.2.1.1. A carbon price	19
2.2.1.2. Subsidies	23
2.2.1.3. A prohibition	26
2.2.1.4. A tax or fee	26
2.2.1.5. Fiscal versus regulatory taxes	29
2.2.2. Environmentally related versus environmental tax	30
2.2.2.1. Classifying taxing forms according to their ability to positively influence the environment	31
2.2.2.1.1. An indirect, in rem tax	31
2.2.3. How is the environmental tax to be applied?	34
2.2.3.1. Value-added (type) taxes	34
2.2.3.2. Sales tax	38
2.2.3.3. Excise taxes	39
2.2.3.4. Ad valorem or in rem	40
2.2.3.5. Manufacturers' or retail excise tax	41
2.2.3.6. Partial conclusion and the way forward	42
2.2.4. Identifying environmental taxes according to the item subject to tax	42

Table of Contents

2.2.4.1.	Introduction	42
2.2.4.2.	Defining environmental taxes	43
2.2.4.3.	The items subject to tax	47
2.2.4.3.1.	Transport	47
2.2.4.3.2.	Motor vehicles	49
2.2.4.3.3.	Natural resources	49
2.2.4.3.4.	Pollution	52
2.2.4.3.5.	Energy and its interrelation with carbon content	53
2.2.5.	Interim conclusion regarding the environmental tax envisioned in the MCTT	58
2.3.	Identifying the legal instrument	60
2.3.1.	Domestic tax legislation	60
2.3.2.	Issuing a harmonizing instrument for the coordination of domestic tax legislation	61
2.3.3.	A tax treaty	63
2.3.3.1.	Bilateral tax treaty coordinated by a model agreement	68
2.3.3.2.	A multilateral carbon tax treaty	70
2.4.	Conclusion	73
Chapter 3:	Principled and Environmental Policy Structures Supporting the Development of the Proposed MCTT	75
3.1.	Introduction	75
3.2.	The models of environmental regulation	78
3.3.	The core principles of environmental regulation and taxation	80
3.3.1.	The “polluter pays” principle	80
3.3.2.	The principle of prevention	83
3.3.3.	Precautionary principle	87
3.3.4.	Interim conclusion	93
3.4.	Secondary principles of environmental taxation	93
3.4.1.	Principle of common but differentiated responsibilities	94
3.4.2.	Principle of free trade while supporting environmental objectives	95

3.5.	General principles of environmental taxation	96
3.5.1.	The 1972 Stockholm Declaration	97
3.5.2.	UN Rio Declaration	100
3.5.3.	Rio+20 outcome document	104
3.5.4.	The Paris Agreement	107
3.5.5.	How these principles are to be advanced under the proposed MCTT	108
3.6.	Linking to tax	108
3.7.	The legal basis for the admission of the proposed MCTT under the UN environmental framework	110
3.8.	The WTO and environmental protection	117
3.9.	Conclusion	120
Chapter 4:	The Fossil Fuel Industry	125
4.1.	Introduction	125
4.2.	The business phases	126
4.2.1.	Upstream activities	128
4.2.2.	Midstream activities	128
4.2.3.	Downstream activities	129
4.3.	The oil and gas industry	130
4.3.1.	Oil qualities	133
4.3.2.	The oil and gas refinery processes	134
4.4.	The coal industry	137
4.5.	Conclusion	139
Chapter 5:	The State of the Art of Environmental Taxation in Selected Surveyed Countries	141
5.1.	The survey	141
5.2.	Tons versus tonnes	145
5.3.	Survey results	147

Table of Contents

5.3.1.	Taxes applied	147
5.3.2.	Creation of a fund	156
5.3.3.	The four-prong test result	158
5.3.4.	Core principles of environmental taxation	163
5.3.5.	Environmentally related versus environmental tax	164
5.3.6.	Trends	165
5.4.	Identifying the price of carbon in the current market	167
5.5.	Conclusion	174
Chapter 6:	The Taxpayer, the Pollutants and the Point of Taxation	181
6.1.	Introduction	181
6.2.	The pollutants	183
6.2.1.	Why energy and GHGs would not be targeted under a global taxing scheme	188
6.2.1.1.	Taxing energy	188
6.2.1.2.	Taxing GHGs	193
6.2.1.2.1.	Carbon dioxide	198
6.2.1.3.	Taxing carbon as an element of mineral resources	202
6.2.1.3.1.	Carbon dioxide-equivalent measurement	205
6.2.1.4.	Interim conclusion	207
6.3.	Point of taxation	208
6.3.1.	Introduction	208
6.3.1.1.	Applying a tax at the downstream level	209
6.3.1.2.	Applying a tax at the midstream level	210
6.3.1.3.	Applying a tax at the upstream level	214
6.4.	The point of taxation under the proposed MCTT	217
6.5.	The principle of territoriality	221
6.6.	The taxpayer	222
6.6.1.	The default rule	222
6.6.2.	Application of a carbon tax at the subsidiary level	223
6.6.2.1.	Secondary allocation (refinery or gas processing facility)	224

6.6.2.2.	Tertiary allocation (importation into consuming country)	224
6.6.3.	Interim conclusion	225
6.7.	Carbon leakage under the proposed multilateral tax treaty	225
6.8.	Application of the tax under existing exploitation contractual structures	228
6.8.1.	Who should bear the burden of the tax in the case of a participation agreement?	229
6.8.2.	When countries conduct the project themselves, would applying a carbon tax upon extraction of the oil, gas or coal imply a self-imposed tax?	231
6.9.	Carrying the environmental effect through the oil and coal production chains and providing relief for non-combustible activities	231
6.9.1.	Oil	232
6.9.1.1.	Compliance obligation leading to the tax's environmental effectiveness	232
6.9.1.2.	Credit for transactions not leading to combustion processes	234
6.9.2.	Coal	236
6.9.2.1.	Compliance obligation leading to the tax's environmental effectiveness	236
6.9.2.2.	Credit for transactions not leading to a combustion process	237
6.10.	Exchange of information	238
6.10.1.	The Dodd Frank Act	239
6.10.2.	EU Directive 2013/34/EU	240
6.10.3.	The EITI	240
6.11.	Conclusion	242
Chapter 7:	Tax Base and Tax Rate	245
7.1.	Introduction	245
7.2.	Carbon tax base	247

Table of Contents

7.3.	Tax rate	250
7.3.1.	The Pigouvian approach	250
7.3.2.	Tax rate based on emission reduction targets	256
7.3.2.1.	Article 2 of the UNFCCC analysed and its influence on the emission reduction targets	273
7.3.2.2.	Climate change markers	274
7.3.3.	Tax rate based on current country practices	276
7.3.3.1.	Methodology	277
7.3.3.2.	Starting the tax rate for developing countries (the below-minimum threshold)	281
7.3.3.3.	Maximum tax rates	284
7.3.3.4.	Tax rate progression and predictability over time	286
7.3.3.5.	Currency indexation	294
7.3.4.	Tax rate progressivity for developing countries	294
7.4.	Conclusion	297
Chapter 8:	Trade-Related Issues	301
8.1.	The fourth prong	301
8.2.	Introduction	304
8.2.1.	The WTO and the GATT	306
8.3.	Part 1 – Interaction between trade, tax and the environment	308
8.3.1.	The relevance of WTO case law	308
8.3.2.	The MFN clause	311
8.3.3.	National treatment	315
8.3.4.	Quantitative restrictions (article XI of the GATT)	320
8.3.5.	GATT exceptions	320
8.3.5.1.	The case law concerning article XX	322
8.3.5.1.1.	Measures qualifying under article XX(b)	322
8.3.5.1.2.	Measures qualifying under article XX(g)	325
8.3.5.1.3.	The chapeau	330
8.3.6.	The proposed MCTT as interpreted by the WTO case law: Partial conclusion and what is revealed by the case law	334
8.4.	Part 2 – The WTO’s capacity to decide environmental issues	336
8.4.1.	The object and purpose of the WTO agreements	338

8.4.2.	The Committee on Trade and Environment	346
8.4.2.1.	The intersection of tax, trade and environmental principles	349
8.4.3.	The interrelation between the WTO and MEAs	350
8.4.4.	How does the institutional framework compare to the DSB's decisions?	357
8.5.	Part 3 – Border tax adjustments	360
8.5.1.	Defining BTAs	363
8.5.1.1.	Product and production tax theory, <i>taxe occulte</i> and BTAs	367
8.5.1.2.	Partial conclusion with respect to BTAs	370
8.5.1.3.	BTAs with respect to developing and least developed countries during the introduction period	371
8.5.2.	Why it is important to have a BTA with respect to non-member countries	372
8.5.3.	Conclusion regarding the admissibility of BTAs	374
8.6.	On subsidies and externalities	375
8.7.	Conclusion	377
Chapter 9:	Tax Treaty Administration	379
9.1.	Introduction	379
9.2.	The choice of an international organization to administer such an agreement	379
9.2.1.	The OECD vs the UN vs the WTO	379
9.3.	The institutions	382
9.3.1.	The OECD	382
9.3.2.	The United Nations	387
9.3.3.	The WTO	389
9.3.3.1.	Multilateral versus plurilateral WTO agreements	394
9.3.3.2.	The WTO Dispute Settlement Body	397
9.3.3.3.	The WTO Trade Policy Review Mechanism	398
9.4.	Joint UN-WTO administration of an environmental programme of multilateral reach	399
9.5.	Withdrawal period	403

Table of Contents

9.6.	Revenue destination and application	404
9.6.1.	The carbon fund	406
9.6.2.	Revenue apportionment	408
9.7.	Conclusion	409
Chapter 10:	The Multilateral Carbon Tax Treaty	411
10.1.	Statement of objectives	411
10.2.	General principles	411
10.3.	Tax operation	413
10.4.	Administration	415
10.5.	The treaty	417
References		439