



Human Rights and Disability

The current use and future potential of United Nations human rights instruments in the context of disability

Gerard Quinn and Theresia Degener

with

Anna Bruce, Christine Burke, Dr. Joshua Castellino, Padraic Kenna,
Dr. Ursula Kilkelly, Shivaun Quinlivan



United Nations
New York and Geneva, 2002

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
Note on contributors.....	vii
Foreword	viii
Acknowledgements	ix
Executive summary	1

Part 1

Background: The shift to a human rights framework of reference

CHAPTER 1	The moral authority for change: human rights values and the worldwide process of disability reform	9
1.1	Human values – the human being as subject and not object	9
1.2	From values to rights: a system of freedom built on human values	13
1.3	The core problem: the “invisibility” of people with disabilities in the system of freedom	15
1.4	Human rights as a “visibility” project in the context of disability	17
CHAPTER 2	The application of moral authority: the shift to the human rights perspective on disability through United Nations “soft” law	19
2.1	Early United Nations General Assembly resolutions on disability	19
2.2	The emergence of the rights model in the 1980s: the World Programme of Action (1982).....	20
2.3	Influential United Nations studies and guidelines	21
2.4	The United Nations Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities (1993)	22
2.5.	World conferences and disability.....	24
2.6	United Nations Commission on Human Rights resolutions and disability	25
2.7	United Nations expert seminars on disability	26
2.8	General Assembly resolution on a convention to promote and protect the rights and dignity of persons with disabilities	28
2.9	Conclusions	29
CHAPTER 3	Building bridges from “soft law” to “hard law”: the relevance of the United Nations human rights instruments to disability	31
3.1	The United Nations human rights treaty system	31
3.2	Navigating the United Nations human rights treaty system	32

Part 2

Evaluation of the current use of the United Nations human rights instruments in the context of disability

CHAPTER 4	Disability and freedom: the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR).....	37
4.1	The relevance of civil and political rights to disability	37
4.2	Enforcement and interpretation of the ICCPR in the context of disability.....	41
4.3	An evaluation of the operation of the ICCPR in the context of disability.....	44
4.4	Disability as a human rights issue in the complaints procedures under the first Optional Protocol to the ICCPR	48
4.5	Conclusions on the ICCPR and disability	50

CHAPTER 5	Disability and social justice: the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	53
5.1	An overview of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	53
5.2	The general application of the ICESCR in the context of persons with a disability	55
5.3	The relevance of specific ICESCR rights in the context of disability	58
5.4	Case studies on the current use of the ICESCR in the context of disability.....	70
5.5	Conclusions on the ICESCR and disability	81
CHAPTER 6	The integrity of the person: the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and disability.....	83
6.1	An overview of the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.....	83
6.2	The general relevance of Convention norms in the context of disability	92
6.3	Case studies on the operation of the Convention in the context of disability	94
6.4	Conclusions on CAT and disability	100
CHAPTER 7	Gender and disability: the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women.....	103
7.1	Introduction to CEDAW	103
7.2	The general application of CEDAW norms in the context of disability.....	107
7.3	Case studies on the current use of CEDAW in the context of disability	111
7.4	Conclusions and future perspectives on CEDAW	116
CHAPTER 8	Disability and children: the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC).....	119
8.1.	Background to the Convention	119
8.2	The relevance of the CRC norms in the context of disability.....	119
8.3	Implementation of the Convention	124
8.4	Case studies on the current operation of the CRC in the context of children with disabilities	129
8.5	The increasing prominence of the disability perspective in the CRC Committee.....	134
8.6	Conclusions on the CRC and disability	140
CHAPTER 9	Disability and racial discrimination: the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD)	141
9.1	Background to the Convention	141
9.2	The Convention enforcement machinery.....	142
9.3	Relevance of ICERD norms in the context of disability	143
9.4	Case studies on State party reports with a disability dimension.....	147
9.5	Conclusions on CERD and disability	147

Part 3

Options for the future: towards maximizing the potential of the United Nations human rights instruments in the context of disability

CHAPTER 10	Civil society: current use of the United Nations human rights system and future choices	151
10.1	Part I: Organizational details	152
10.2	Part II: Self-understanding of disability NGOs as human rights defenders (questions 1-6)	153
10.3	Part III: Self-evaluation of human rights capacities (questions 7-18).....	154
10.4	Part IV: Current levels of DPO/INGO engagement with the United Nations human rights machinery	158

10.5	Part IV: Outcome of engagement with the human rights treaty monitoring bodies	162
10.6.	Part VI: The future.....	165
10.7	Conclusions on the NGO questionnaire	167
CHAPTER 11	National human rights institutions – catalysts for change.....	169
11.1	Level of disability awareness (questions 1-3)	169
11.2	The status of disability rights on the agenda of national institutions (questions 4-7) ...	170
11.3	The disability rights record of national institutions (questions 8-11).....	171
11.4	Litigation on disability rights	173
11.5	Education and capacity-building (questions 15 and 16).....	173
11.6	Disability and the law reform process (questions 17 and 18).....	174
11.7	Conclusions	176
CHAPTER 12	Recommendations: Making the United Nations human rights machinery work better in the context of disability	177
12.1	States parties – towards a more sustained focus on persons with disabilities as the beneficiaries of the human rights treaties	177
12.2	Treaty monitoring bodies – towards the mainstreaming of disability	177
12.3	The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights – advancing disability as a human rights issue	178
12.4	United Nations Commission for Human Rights – bringing disability onto the agenda.....	178
12.5	National human rights institutions – enabling reform to come about	179
12.6	Civil society – disability NGOs as human rights NGOs	179
CHAPTER 13	Expanding the system: the debate about a disability-specific convention	181
13.1	Growing support for a thematic convention	181
13.2	A thematic convention as a way of enhancing the “visibility” of people with disabilities in the human rights system.....	182
13.3	The practical benefits of a thematic convention	182
13.4	Dignity and equality as the key to the content of a thematic convention	183
13.5	The new freedom agenda and disability: the interdependence of all human rights.....	183
13.6	A thematic convention as an aid to the mainstreaming of disability in United Nations human rights instruments	183
13.7	The mutually reinforcing roles of a thematic convention and the United Nations Standard Rules	183