

Brian Paltridge

The Discourse of Peer Review

Reviewing Submissions to Academic Journals

palgrave
macmillan

Contents

1	Peer Review in Academic Settings	1
	Peer Review in Academic Settings	1
	Reviews of Research Grant Applications	2
	Reviews of Promotion and Tenure Track Applications	8
	Peer Review of Academic Books	12
	Book Reviews	12
	Book Blurbs	13
	Peer Review of Book Proposals	15
	Reviews for Book Proposals	16
	Reviews for a Second Edition of a Book	18
	Proposals for Edited Collections	20
	Peer Review of Journal Articles	21
	The History of Editorial Peer Review	22
	The Process of Editorial Peer Review	23
	Overview of the Study	25
	The Reviewers' Reports	27
	Overview of the Book	28
2	The Genre of Reviewers' Reports	31
	The Context of Reviewers' Reports	35
	The Discourse Structure of Reviewers' Reports	38

The Accept Reviews	41
The Minor Revisions Reviews	42
The Major Revisions Reviews	45
The Reject Reviews	47
The Content of Reviewers' Reports	49
The Accept Reviews	52
The Minor Revisions Reviews	54
The Major Revisions Reviews	56
The Reject Reviews	61
Positive and Negative Comments in All the Reviews	63
Conclusions	64
3 Pragmatics and Reviewers' Reports	67
Pragmatics and Discourse	68
Speech Acts and the Interpretation of Texts	69
The Language of Reviewers' Reports	72
Speech Acts and the Reviewers' Reports	74
Experience of the Reviewers	81
Language Background of the Reviewers	83
Discussion	84
Conclusions	87
4 Politeness and Reviewers' Reports	91
Politeness and Face	92
Politeness and Gender	95
Face-Threatening Acts	96
Politeness and Reviewers' Reports	98
The Accept Reviews	100
The Minor Revisions Reviews	102
The Major Revisions Reviews	105
The Reject Reviews	107
Conclusions	111

5	Evaluation and Reviewers' Reports	115
	Corpus Studies of Academic Discourse	120
	Stance and Academic Writing	122
	Evaluative Language in the Reports	124
	The Accept Reviews	124
	The Minor Revisions Reviews	126
	The Major Revisions Reviews	127
	The Reject Reviews	129
	Reviewer Roles in the Reports	132
	The Accept Reviews	135
	The Minor Revisions Reviews	136
	The Major Revisions Reviews	138
	The Reject Reviews	140
	Conclusions	142
6	Learning to Do Peer Review	145
	Training and Mentoring in Peer Review	145
	Learning to Do Peer Review	148
	How They Learnt to Write Reviews	148
	Language Background of the Reviewers	150
	The Most Challenging Aspects of Writing Reviews	151
	The Most Straightforward Aspects of Writing Reviews	152
	Discussion	153
	Implications for Reviewer Training	154
	Conclusion	155
7	Implications for Reviewer Training	157
	Workshop: Understanding the Peer Review Process	159
	Tasks: Understanding the Peer Review Process	162
	The Peer Review Process	162
	The Initial Culling of Submissions	163
	Review Criteria and Types of Journal	166
	Reviewing Submissions to Academic Journals	168

x Contents

From Reviewers' Reports to the Final Version of an Academic Article	172
Implications for Successful Academic Publishing	174
Tasks: Understanding Reviewers' Reports	174
The Genre of Reviewers' Reports	174
The Content of Reviewers' Reports	175
Pragmatics and Reviewers' Reports	175
Politeness and Reviewers' Reports	177
Evaluation in Reviewers' Reports	177
Conclusion	177
8 Conclusions	183
Appendix: Questionnaire for the Reviewers	195
References	197
Index	223