

Argument and Inference

An Introduction to Inductive Logic

Gregory Johnson

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

Contents

Preface ix

1 An Introduction to Arguments 1

- 1.1 Premises and a Conclusion 1
- 1.2 Deductively Valid and Inductively Strong 4
- 1.3 Soundness and Reliability 9
- 1.4 Some Argument Forms 11
 - 1.4.1 Modus Ponens 11
 - 1.4.2 Modus Tollens 13
 - 1.4.3 Inductive Generalization 13
 - 1.4.4 Proportional Syllogism 15
 - 1.4.5 Induction by Confirmation 16
 - 1.4.6 Analogical Argument 18
- 1.5 A Note about Reading Arguments 21
- 1.6 Exercises 23
- 1.7 Answers 28

2 The Induction by Confirmation 35

- 2.1 Halley's Comet 35
- 2.2 The Hypothesis, Prediction, and Data 36
 - 2.2.1 The Hypothesis 36
 - 2.2.2 The Prediction 37
 - 2.2.3 The Data 39
- 2.3 The Induction by Confirmation 41
 - 2.3.1 The Structure of the Argument 41
 - 2.3.2 Halley's Argument 42

2.4	Other Conclusions	44
2.4.1	Why Do Humans Reason?	44
2.4.2	An Indeterminate Hypothesis	45
2.4.3	Premise 5	46
2.4.4	A Failed Hypothesis: Spontaneous Generation	47
2.5	The Inference	49
2.5.1	An Indirect Inference	49
2.5.2	Valid and Invalid Arguments	49
2.6	Exercises	53
2.7	Answers	61
3	More on the Induction by Confirmation	67
3.1	The Crucial Experiment	67
3.2	The Inference to the Best Explanation	71
3.2.1	The Best Hypothesis	73
3.2.2	The IBE and IC	76
3.3	Exercises	78
3.4	Answers	89
4	Mill's Methods	99
4.1	Necessary and Sufficient Conditions	100
4.1.1	Conditionals and Necessary and Sufficient Conditions	102
4.2	Mill's First Three Methods	104
4.2.1	The Method of Agreement	104
4.2.2	The Method of Difference	105
4.2.3	Necessary and Sufficient Conditions Again	107
4.2.4	The Joint Method of Agreement and Difference	109
4.3	Typhoid Mary	110
4.4	Mill's Fourth and Fifth Methods	114
4.4.1	The Method of Residues	114
4.4.2	The Method of Concomitant Variations	116
4.5	Exercises	118
4.6	Answers	125
5	Describing Populations	131
5.1	Variables and Their Values	132
5.2	Describing a Population with Two Variables	133

5.3	Difference in Proportions, Independence, and Association	134
5.3.1	Difference in Proportions	134
5.3.2	Independent and Associated	135
5.4	The Strengths of Positive and Negative Associations	136
5.5	Information about a Population	138
5.6	Measuring the Strength of an Association (Again)	140
5.7	Exercises	141
5.8	Answers	143
6	The Proportional Syllogism	151
6.1	Probability and Proportion	151
6.2	The Theory of Probability	152
6.2.1	The General Conjunction Rule	154
6.2.2	The Conditional Probability Rule	155
6.2.3	The Special Conjunction Rule	155
6.2.4	The Special Disjunction Rule	157
6.2.5	The General Disjunction Rule	158
6.3	Relative Risk	159
6.4	Calculating the Probability for Multiple Individuals	161
6.5	The Proportional Syllogism	164
6.5.1	A Note about Evaluating Arguments	167
6.6	Exercises	169
6.7	Answers	175
7	The Inductive Generalization	189
7.1	Introduction	189
7.2	Calculating the Probability of an Interval	191
7.3	The 95 Percent Interval	193
7.4	An Example of an Inductive Generalization	196
7.5	The Conclusion of an Inductive Generalization	200
7.6	Inductive Strength	202
7.7	Exercises	203
7.8	Answers	207
8	Bayes' Rule	213
8.1	Bayes' Rule	213
8.2	Example 1: Two Jars of Marbles	214
8.3	Example 2: The Stolen \$1.3 Million	215

- 8.4 The Argument Using Bayes' Rule 218
- 8.5 Example 3: A Match Made with Bayes' Rule 220
- 8.6 Example 4: A Positive Mammogram 222
- 8.7 Exercises 223
- 8.8 Answers 227

Appendices

A A Brief Introduction to Deductive Logic 235

- A.1 Some Rules of Deductive Logic 235
 - A.1.1 *And* and *Or* Rules 235
 - A.1.2 *If-Then* Rules 237
- A.2 Categorical Syllogisms 239
- A.3 Exercises 240
- A.4 Answers 243

B Some Further Topics on Probability 247

- B.1 Odds 247
- B.2 Expected Value 250
- B.3 Where Do Probabilities Come From? 254
 - B.3.1 Proportion of a Population 254
 - B.3.2 Frequency 255
 - B.3.3 Betting 255
- B.4 Exercises 257
- B.5 Answers 261

Index 267