

OXFORD PHILOSOPHICAL MONOGRAPHS

Category Mistakes

OFRA MAGIDOR

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
1 Introduction	1
§1 The Phenomenon of Category Mistakes	1
§2 Category Mistakes in the Philosophical Literature	7
§3 Category Mistakes in the Linguistics Literature	15
§4 Category Mistakes in Computer Science	20
§5 Conclusion	23
2 The Syntactic Approach	25
§1 The Syntactic Approach to Category Mistakes	25
§2 Some Unsatisfactory Arguments Against the Syntactic Approach	30
§2.1 The simplicity argument	30
§2.2 The meaningfulness argument	32
§2.3 The argument from universality	32
§3 The Argument from Particularity	35
§4 The Argument from Embedding	38
§5 Interactions with Meanings	39
§6 Interactions with Extra-Linguistic Facts	40
§7 Interactions with Context	42
3 The Meaninglessness View	43
§1 The Meaninglessness View of Category Mistakes	43
§2 The Argument(s) from Compositionality	46
§2.1 Atomic category mistakes	46
§2.2 Type-theoretic semantics to the rescue?	48
§2.3 Conjunctions and quantifier phrases	56
§3 The Argument from Synonymy	58
§4 The Argument from Propositional Attitude Ascriptions	59

CONTENTS

§5	The Argument from Metaphor	66
§6	Arguments in Favour of the Meaninglessness View?	74
§6.1	The imagination motivation	75
§6.2	The motivation from alternative theories of meaning	76
§6.3	The nonsense motivation	79
4	The MBT View	80
§1	The MBT View	80
§2	A General Argument Against the MBT View	83
§3	Arguments in Favour of the MBT View	91
§3.1	The infelicity argument	91
§3.2	Routley's transfer argument	94
§3.3	The arbitrariness argument	95
§4	The Supervaluationist Treatment of Category Mistakes	99
§4.1	The formal details	99
§4.2	Validity and implication	101
§4.3	The problem of complex category mistakes	106
5	The Pragmatic Approach	110
§1	The Pragmatic Approach	110
§2	The Naïve Pragmatic Approach	111
§3	The Background Framework: Pragmatic Presuppositions	116
§3.1	Tests for presupposition	117
§3.2	Foundational issues	124
§4	A Presuppositional Account of Category Mistakes	131
§4.1	A basic example	131
§4.2	Other cases	140
§4.3	Characterizing category mistakes?	146
§5	Merits of the Account	148
§6	Postscript: Some Final Reflections on the Implications of the Account	154
	<i>References</i>	159
	<i>Index</i>	167