

# CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xii
INTRODUCTION	1
1 Topics and Aims	1
2 Structure of the Book and Links between the Topics	2
3 Method	4
PART I. Rule-Following	7
CHAPTER ONE. Kripke's Skepticism about Meaning	9
4 Assertion and Meaning	9
5 Kripke's Dialectical Skepticism	10
6 A First Look at Kripke's Understanding of Meaning	11
7 Assertion, Meaning, Truth Conditions, and Rules	13
8 The Rule Determines My Answer	15
9 Following and Being Guided by a Rule	17
10 The Normativity of Assertion and Meaning	18
11 Normativity, Past Intentions, and Future Use	19
12 Kripke's Skeptical Strategy	20
13 Kripke's Skeptical Challenge	23
14 The Challenge to Cite Facts That Determine What We Meant	25
15 Kripke's Skeptical Arguments	31
16 Kripke's Skeptical Conclusion	35
17 Kripke's Objectifying Move	36
18 Kripke's Metaphysical Realism	38

CHAPTER TWO. Quine's Scientific Skepticism about Meaning	40
19 Dialectical Skepticism Contrasted with Scientific Skepticism	40
20 Quine's Scientific Naturalism	41
21 Naturalized Epistemology	43
22 Posits and Reality	46
23 From Naturalized Epistemology to Indeterminacy of Translation	47
24 Collateral Information and Stimulus Meaning	49
25 Inscrutability of Reference	50
26 The Limits of Objective Translation	52
27 Underdetermination and Indeterminacy	53
28 Inscrutability of Reference and Acquiescing in Our Mother Tongue	55
29 Logic, Disquotation, and Indeterminacy	59
30 Quine's Objectifying Move	61
31 Quine's Objectifying Move Contrasted with Kripke's	63
CHAPTER THREE. The Very Idea of a Participant Perspective	65
32 Toward a New Way of Looking at Meaning and Assertion	65
33 A Metaphysical Critique of Scientific Naturalism	66
34 The Fallacy of Subtraction	67
35 Is Quine's Scientific Naturalism a Kind of Idealism?	68
36 A Metaphilosophical Moral	70
37 A First Look at McDowell's Strategy	71
38 McDowell's Critique of Kripke	73
39 McDowell's Critique of Wright	75
40 McDowell's Transcendental Argument and the Middle Course	79
41 Two Problematic Assumptions of McDowell's Argument	83

42	A Metaphysical Realist Critique of McDowell's Arguments and His Middle Course	83
43	A Reply from Wright	85
44	A Reply from Quine	88
45	Do These Criticisms Rest on a Misunderstanding of McDowell?	89
46	The Methodological Moral	90
47	My Strategy in the Rest of the Book	91
PART II. The Analytic-Synthetic Distinction		95
CHAPTER FOUR. Carnap's Analytic-Synthetic Distinction		97
48	Carnap's Project: The Codification of a Methodology for Rational Inquiry	97
49	Pure and Descriptive Semantics, Explicit Rules, and Language Systems	98
50	The Principle of Tolerance	99
51	A First Sketch of the Pragmatic Roots of Carnap's Analytic-Synthetic Distinction	101
52	Quine's Criticism of the Thesis That Logic Is True by Convention	103
53	Carnap's Pragmatic Approach to Codifying Rules for Inquiry	105
54	Mistakes and Discoveries in Logic and Mathematics	107
55	'Analytic in L' in Terms of State Descriptions	108
56	'Analytic in L' in Terms of State Descriptions and Meaning Postulates	112
57	Pure and Descriptive Semantics	114
58	Reichenbach's Coordinative Definitions	116
59	The Analogy between Physical Geometry and Descriptive Semantics	117
60	Beth's Criticism of Pure Semantics	121
61	Carnap's Reply to Beth	122

CHAPTER FIVE. Quine's Reasons for Rejecting Carnap's Analytic-Synthetic Distinction	126
62 A Strategy for Clarifying Quine's Dispute with Carnap	126
63 A Puzzling Exchange between Carnap and Quine	127
64 Carnap and Quine on Language and Logic	128
65 Carnap and Quine on the Interpretation of Artificial Notations	129
66 Quine on Truth by Convention Again	130
67 Preliminaries for Understanding Quine's Critique of Analyticity	132
68 Definition and Interchangeability	134
69 Semantical Rules	137
70 Postulates, Semantical Rules, and the Task of Logic	140
71 Indeterminacy and Carnap's Analytic-Synthetic Distinction	142
72 Does Carnap Need a Criterion of Analyticity?	143
73 Holism and the Analytic-Synthetic Distinction	146
74 Carnap's Method versus Quine's Doctrine	149
CHAPTER SIX. Putnam's Reasons for Rejecting Carnap's Analytic-Synthetic Distinction	152
75 Putnam and the Participant Perspective	152
76 The Roots and Strategy of Putnam's Arguments	153
77 Changes in Belief versus Changes in Reference	155
78 Law-Cluster Concepts and Terms	157
79 Framework Principles and the Contextually A Priori	158
80 An Objection from Carnap's Point of View	159
81 A Reply from Putnam's Point of View	161
82 Analyticity and One-Criterion Words	163
83 The Method behind Putnam's Criticisms	164
84 Why Putnam's Critique of the Analytic-Synthetic Distinction is Incompatible with Quine's	166
85 Against Indeterminacy	170
86 Four Preliminary Concerns	172

PART III. Anti-Individualism	177
CHAPTER SEVEN. From the Rejection of the Analytic-Synthetic Distinction to Anti-Individualism	179
87 The Participant Perspective and Anti-Individualism	179
88 Sameness of Reference despite Radical Changes in Belief	181
89 Idiolects, Disquotation and Changes in Belief	182
90 Kripke's Causal Picture of Reference	186
91 Putnam's Assimilation of Kripke's Causal Picture of Reference	189
92 Two Roles for the Causal Picture of Reference	193
93 The Division of Linguistic Labor and the Contribution of the Environment	196
94 The Standard Metaphysical Picture of the Contribution of the Environment	201
95 Two Versions of the Standard Metaphysical Picture	203
96 Donnellan's Puzzle	204
97 Vernacular Natural Kinds and Artifact Terms	209
98 The Division of Linguistic Labor across Time	212
99 Against Metaphysical Realism	215
100 Our Linguistic Obligations	217
101 Putnam's Causal Picture of Reference and Anti-Individualism	219
CHAPTER EIGHT. Participation, Deference, and Dialectic	223
102 Anti-Individualism from Putnam to Burge	223
103 Burge's Starting Point, Content Clauses, and Notions	224
104 Step One of Burge's Arthritis Thought Experiment	227
105 Steps Two and Three of Burge's Arthritis Thought Experiment	232
106 Norms for Understanding, Conventional Linguistic Meaning, and Cognitive Value	234
107 Complete and Incomplete Understanding and the Structure of Burge's Thought Experiments	238

108	Essentialism and Rationalism about Notions	242
109	A Strategy for Deflating Burge's Anti-Individualism	245
110	Hare on Dancing the Eightsome Reel	247
111	Burge's Dialectic Deflated	250
112	A Deflationary View of Truth, Notions, and Contents	252
CHAPTER NINE. Realism, Self-Knowledge, and Skepticism		255
113	A Challenge from within the Participant Perspective	255
114	Realism and Self-Knowledge in Context	259
115	Self-Knowledge and Metalinguistic Beliefs	262
116	Problematic Possibilities	263
117	Why Skepticism about Self-Knowledge Is Incoherent	267
118	The Misunderstanding behind Skepticism about Self- Knowledge	272
119	Problematic Possibilities Disarmed	274
120	Empirical Presuppositions and Skeptical Possibilities	276
121	Two More Problematic Possibilities	280
122	Empirical Presuppositions and Skeptical Possibilities Again	282
123	Does Anti-Individualism Beg the Question against Skepticism?	284
124	Truth and the Absolute Conception of Reality	287
125	Nagel's Abstract Skepticism	289
126	The Dissolution of the Absolute Conception of Reality	292
CHAPTER TEN. Anti-Individualism and Rule-Following		295
127	Rule-Following Reconsidered	295
128	Kripke's Dialectical Skepticism	295
129	Rule-Following from the Participant Perspective	297
130	How to Resist Kripke's Picture of Meaning and Assertion	300

131	A Skeptical Reply	302
132	Quine's Scientific Skepticism	304
133	How to Resist Quine's Picture of Meaning and Assertion	307
134	A Quinean Reply	309
NOTES		313
INDEX		364