

# Causal Mediation Analysis

**GEOFFREY T. WODTKE**

*University of Chicago*

**XIANG ZHOU**

*Harvard University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i>	<i>xiii</i>
1 Introduction		I
1.1 Mediation in the Social Sciences		2
1.1.1 The Effects of Education on Mental Health		3
1.1.2 Media Discourse, Public Opinion, and Immigration		4
1.1.3 Workforce Development Programs and Employment		5
1.2 The Promise of Causal Mediation Analysis		6
1.3 A Brief History		8
1.4 Our Distinctive Approach		10
1.5 An Outline of the Book		13
1.6 Statistical Software		16
2 Foundations of Causal Inference		17
2.1 Measures of Association		19
2.2 Measures of Causation		20
2.2.1 Potential Outcomes		21
2.2.2 Individual Causal Effects		22
2.2.3 Average Causal Effects		24
2.2.4 The Fundamental Problem of Causal Inference		26
2.3 Resolving the Fundamental Problem		28
2.3.1 Identifying Individual Causal Effects		28
2.3.2 Identifying Average Causal Effects		30
2.4 Directed Acyclic Graphs		35
2.4.1 Elements of a DAG		36
2.4.2 DAGs as Nonparametric Causal Models		37
2.4.3 DAGs, Interventions, and Potential Outcomes		39
2.4.4 Sources of Statistical Association in DAGs		40
2.4.5 Identification Analysis with DAGs		43

2.5	Direct and Indirect Causation	45
2.5.1	A Simple Model of Mediation	46
2.5.2	Nested and Cross-World Potential Outcomes	47
2.5.3	The Fundamental Problem of Causal Mediation	51
3	Mediation Analysis with Baseline Confounding	54
3.1	Graphical Mediation Models	55
3.2	Causal Estimands	60
3.2.1	The Average Total Effect	60
3.2.2	Natural Direct and Indirect Effects	61
3.2.3	The Controlled Direct Effect	63
3.3	Nonparametric Identification	65
3.3.1	Nonparametric Identification of Average Total Effects	67
3.3.2	Nonparametric Identification of Controlled Direct Effects	73
3.3.3	Nonparametric Identification of Natural Direct and Indirect Effects	78
3.4	Nonparametric Estimation	86
3.5	Parametric Estimation	94
3.5.1	Estimation with Linear Models	97
3.5.2	Estimation via Simulation	103
3.5.3	Estimation with Inverse Probability Weights	113
3.6	Statistical Inference	123
3.7	Sensitivity Analysis	131
3.7.1	Nonparametric Bias Formulas	133
3.7.2	Bias from Exposure-Outcome Confounding	135
3.7.3	Bias from Mediator-Outcome Confounding	136
3.7.4	Bias from Exposure-Mediator Confounding	137
3.7.5	Bias-Adjusted Effect Estimates	137
3.8	The Effect of Job Training on Employment	138
3.9	Summary	144
4	Mediation Analysis with Exposure-Induced Confounding	146
4.1	Graphical Models with Multiple Mediators	149
4.2	Limitations of the Natural Effects Decomposition	154
4.3	Interventional Direct and Indirect Effects	159
4.4	Nonparametric Identification	164
4.4.1	Nonparametric Identification of Controlled Direct Effects	164
4.4.2	Nonparametric Identification of Interventional Direct and Indirect Effects	169
4.5	Nonparametric Estimation	177
4.6	Parametric Estimation	181

4.6.1	Estimation Using Linear Models: Regression-with-Residuals	182
4.6.2	Estimation via Simulation	189
4.6.3	Estimation with Inverse Probability Weights	201
4.7	Statistical Inference	210
4.8	Sensitivity Analysis	213
4.8.1	Nonparametric Bias Formulas	214
4.8.2	Bias from Exposure-Outcome Confounding	215
4.8.3	Bias from Mediator-Outcome Confounding	216
4.8.4	Bias from Exposure-Mediator Confounding	218
4.8.5	Bias-Adjusted Effect Estimates	219
4.9	The Effect of Plow Use on Female Political Participation	221
4.10	Summary	228
5	Mediation Analysis with Multiple Mediators	230
5.1	The One-Mediator-at-a-Time Approach	232
5.2	The Multiple-Mediators-as-a-Whole Approach	237
5.3	Effect Decomposition with Multiple Mediators	244
5.3.1	Path-Specific Effects	246
5.3.2	Connections with Natural Direct and Indirect Effects	248
5.4	Nonparametric Identification	249
5.5	Nonparametric Estimation	251
5.6	Parametric Estimation	255
5.6.1	Estimation with Linear Models	256
5.6.2	Estimation with Inverse Probability Weights	258
5.6.3	Estimation with Regression Imputation	261
5.7	Generalization to $K(\geq 2)$ Causally Ordered Mediators	265
5.8	Sensitivity Analysis	268
5.8.1	Nonparametric Bias Formulas	269
5.8.2	Bias from Exposure-Outcome Confounding	271
5.8.3	Bias from Mediator-Outcome Confounding	272
5.8.4	Bias from Exposure-Mediator Confounding	273
5.8.5	Bias-Adjusted Effect Estimates	274
5.9	The Effect of Media Framing on Immigration Attitudes	276
5.10	Summary	281
6	Mediation Analysis with Robust Estimation Methods	286
6.1	Robust Estimation of Average Total Effects	289
6.1.1	Limitations of Parametric Estimators	289
6.1.2	Doubly Robust Estimation	292
6.1.3	Debiased Machine Learning	294
6.1.4	Statistical Inference	296
6.1.5	The Effect of College Attendance on Depression	297
6.2	Robust Estimation of Natural Direct and Indirect Effects	299

6.3	Robust Estimation of Interventional Direct and Indirect Effects	305
6.4	Robust Estimation of Path-Specific Effects	311
6.5	The Multigenerational Effects of Political Violence on Attitudes	317
6.6	Summary	321
7	Mediation Analysis with (Quasi-)Experimental Methods	323
7.1	Conventional Experiments and Their Limitations	326
7.2	Experimental Designs for Analyzing Causal Mediation	329
7.2.1	Joint and Sequential Randomization Designs	331
7.2.2	A Parallel Randomization Design	334
7.2.3	A Multi-Arm Randomization Design	340
7.2.4	Limitations	345
7.3	Quasi-experimental Designs for Analyzing Causal Mediation	346
7.3.1	Instrumental Variable (IV) Analyses with an Instrumented Exposure	347
7.3.2	IV Analyses with an Instrumented Mediator	354
7.3.3	Difference-in-Difference (DiD) Models for Total Effects	362
7.3.4	DiD Models for Direct and Indirect Effects	367
7.4	Summary	374
8	The Future of Causal Mediation Analysis	376
8.1	Alternative Estimands	377
8.2	Longitudinal Analyses	379
8.3	Complex Sample Designs	381
8.4	Measurement Error	383
8.5	Robust Estimation Methods	385
8.6	Experimental and Quasi-experimental Methods	386
8.7	Conclusion	387
	<i>Appendix A Nonparametric Identification of the Average Total Effect</i>	389
	<i>Appendix B Nonparametric Identification of the Controlled Direct Effect</i>	391
	<i>Appendix C Nonparametric Identification of the Natural Direct Effect</i>	393
	<i>Appendix D Nonparametric Identification of the Natural Indirect Effect</i>	395
	<i>Appendix E Natural Effects under Linear and Additive Models</i>	397
	<i>Appendix F Ratio of Mediator Probability Weighting</i>	401

<i>Appendix G Nonparametric Identification of CDEs with Exposure-Induced Confounding</i>	403
<i>Appendix H Nonparametric Identification of the Interventional Direct Effect</i>	405
<i>Appendix I Nonparametric Identification of the Interventional Indirect Effect</i>	407
<i>Appendix J Bias Formulas for PSEs with <math>K \geq 2</math> Causally Ordered Mediators</i>	409
<i>References</i>	413
<i>Index</i>	429