

THE
FOUNDATIONS OF
EUROPEAN UNION
LAW

AN INTRODUCTION TO THE
CONSTITUTIONAL AND
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW OF THE
EUROPEAN UNION

Ninth Edition

TREVOR HARTLEY

*Professor of Law Emeritus
London School of Economics and Political Science*

TAKIS TRIDIMAS

*Professor and Director, Luxembourg Centre for European Law,
University of Luxembourg
Visiting Professor, College of Europe, Bruges and
Distinguished Visiting Scholar, College of Law, Florida State University*

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

PART I HISTORY AND OBJECTIVES OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

1	A BRIEF HISTORY: FROM COAL AND STEEL TO THE EUROPEAN UNION	3
2	OBJECTIVES, SCHEME, AND NATURE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	15

PART II THE INSTITUTIONS

3	THE POLITICAL INSTITUTIONS	33
4	THE COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	95

PART III THE EU LEGAL SYSTEM

5	THE CONSTITUTIVE TREATIES	161
6	EU VALUES AND THE GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF EU LAW	180
7	FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND THE CHARTER OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	238
8	INTERNATIONAL AGREEMENTS CONCLUDED BY THE UNION	281
9	AGREEMENTS CONCLUDED BY THE MEMBER STATES	323
10	HIERARCHY AND CONFLICT OF PRIMARY SOURCES	341
11	THE COMPETENCE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	348
12	THE PRINCIPLE OF PRIMACY	382
13	DIRECT EFFECT	398
14	THE NATIONAL REACTION	448
15	UNION ACTS	479

PART IV JUDICIAL PROTECTION

16	REVIEWABLE ACTS	513
17	<i>LOCUS STANDI</i>	541
18	REVIEW, TIME LIMIT, AND ANNULMENT	587
19	FAILURE TO ACT	615
20	INDIRECT CHALLENGE	637
21	UNION OBLIGATIONS	650
22	ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS	706
23	PRELIMINARY REFERENCES	740
24	THE PROTECTION OF EU RIGHTS IN NATIONAL COURTS	794

PART V BREXIT

25	THE WITHDRAWAL OF THE UNITED KINGDOM AND EU-UK RELATIONS POST-BREXIT	825
----	---	-----

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>CJEU Alphabetical Table of Cases</i>	xxix
<i>CJEU Numerical Table of Cases</i>	lxi
<i>Table of European Court of Human Rights Cases</i>	xciii
<i>Table of English, Scottish, and Irish Cases</i>	xciv
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xcvii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	cix

PART I HISTORY AND OBJECTIVES OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

1 A BRIEF HISTORY: FROM COAL AND STEEL TO THE EUROPEAN UNION	3
1.1. Origins	3
1.2. Successive Enlargement and One Withdrawal	5
1.3. Substantive Treaty Amendments	8
1.4. From Crisis to Crisis	11
Further Reading	13
2 OBJECTIVES, SCHEME, AND NATURE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	15
2.1. The Objectives of the Union	15
2.2. The Economic Constitution of the EU	19
2.3. Expansion of EU Competence to Other Areas	23
2.4. The Substantive Constitution of the EU	25
2.5. The Legal Nature of the Union	27
Further Reading	29

PART II THE INSTITUTIONS

3 THE POLITICAL INSTITUTIONS	33
3.1. Introduction	33
3.2. The European Parliament	34
3.2.1. Composition	34
3.2.2. Privileges and Immunities	38
3.2.3. Political Parties	39
3.2.4. Committees	40
3.2.5. Parliamentary Questions	40
3.2.6. Proposals, Inquiries, and Petitions	40

3.2.7.	The Ombudsman	41
3.2.8.	Involvement in Law-Making	41
3.2.8.1.	Consent Procedure	42
3.2.8.2.	Consultation	43
3.2.9.	Control of the Union Executive	44
3.2.9.1.	Approval of the Commission	44
3.2.9.2.	Censure of the Commission	45
3.2.10.	Conclusions	45
3.3.	The European Council	46
3.4.	The Council	48
3.4.1.	Introduction	48
3.4.2.	COREPER	49
3.4.3.	Voting	50
3.4.3.1.	Simple Majority	50
3.4.3.2.	Unanimity	50
3.4.3.3.	Qualified Majority Voting (QMV)	51
3.4.3.4.	Law and Political Reality: Luxembourg, Ioannina, and Lisbon	53
3.5.	The Commission	58
3.5.1.	Role and Responsibilities	58
3.5.2.	Composition	59
3.5.3.	Appointment of President	59
3.5.4.	Appointment of the Other Commissioners	61
3.5.5.	Functioning and Organization	62
3.5.6.	Assessment	63
3.6.	The European Central Bank	64
3.7.	The Court of Auditors	67
3.8.	The Common Foreign and Security Policy	69
3.8.1.	Development and Special Features	69
3.8.2.	The Common Security and Defence Policy	70
3.8.3.	The High Representative of the Union for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy	70
3.9.	Bodies, Offices, Agencies, and Other Entities	71
3.9.1.	The Economic and Social Committee	71
3.9.2.	The Committee of the Regions	72
3.9.3.	The Euro Group	72
3.9.4.	Agencies	74
3.10.	The Law-Making Process	80
3.10.1.	The European Citizens Initiative (ECI)	80
3.10.2.	The Ordinary Legislative Procedure	81
3.10.3.	The Special Legislative Procedure	85
3.11.	The Union Budget	85
3.11.1.	The Union Finances	85
3.11.2.	The Budgetary Procedure	89
3.12.	Assessment	90
	Further Reading	92

4	THE COURT OF JUSTICE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	95
4.1.	Introduction	95
4.2.	Article 19 TEU: The Rule of Law, the Separation of Powers, and the Bifurcated Nature of the EU Judicial System	96
4.3.	Composition, Appointment and Tenure	98
4.3.1.	Composition	98
4.3.2.	Method of Appointment and Tenure	100
4.3.3.	The Consultative Panel of Article 255 TFEU	101
4.3.4.	The Role of the Advocate General	103
4.4.	Jurisdiction	107
4.4.1.	Categories of Jurisdiction	107
4.4.2.	Direct Actions	107
4.4.2.1.	Types of Action	107
4.4.2.2.	GC Jurisdiction at First Instance	109
4.4.3.	Preliminary References	110
4.4.4.	Opinions on Envisaged International Treaties	110
4.4.5.	Interim Measures	110
4.5.	The Exclusivity of the CJEU's Jurisdiction	113
4.6.	Limitations on Jurisdiction	116
4.6.1.	CFSP	116
4.6.2.	Judicial Cooperation in Criminal Matters	121
4.7.	Organization and Procedure	122
4.7.1.	Organization	122
4.7.2.	Procedure	123
4.7.3.	The Collegiality of the Judgment	126
4.8.	The Judicial Architecture and the Reform of 2015	127
4.8.1.	The Judicial Architecture	127
4.8.2.	The General Court	128
4.8.3.	Appeals	130
4.8.4.	Judicial Caseload	131
4.8.5.	The Reform of the GC	134
4.9.	Transfer of Preliminary References to the GC	135
4.9.1.	The Reform	135
4.9.2.	Independent Questions	137
4.9.3.	Safety Valves	139
4.9.3.1.	<i>Ex Ante</i> Control: Verification by the ECJ	139
4.9.3.2.	<i>In Media Res</i> Control	139
4.9.3.3.	<i>Ex Post</i> Control	140
4.9.4.	Procedural Guarantees to Ensure Uniformity	140
4.9.5.	Conclusion	142
4.10.	Precedent	142
4.10.1.	Is the Court Bound by its Own Case-Law?	142
4.10.2.	Binding Effect of ECJ Rulings vis-à-vis the GC	147
4.10.3.	Binding Effect of ECJ Rulings vis-à-vis National Courts	147
4.11.	Interpretation	149
4.12.	Policy	152
	Further Reading	156

PART III THE EU LEGAL SYSTEM

Introduction: Sources and Authority	159
Further Reading	160
5 THE CONSTITUTIVE TREATIES	161
5.1. Evolution of the Treaties	161
5.2. The TEU and the TFEU: Ranking and Legal Effect	164
5.3. Treaty Revision	164
5.3.1. The Ordinary Revision Procedure	164
5.3.2. The Simplified Revision Procedure	166
5.4. Accession of New States	170
5.5. Withdrawal of a Member State	172
5.6. Protocols and Declarations	177
5.7. Acts of the Representatives of the Member States	178
Further Reading	179
6 EU VALUES AND THE GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF EU LAW	180
6.1. Introduction	180
6.2. Article 2 TEU: The Union Values	180
6.2.1. Values and Liberal Democracy	180
6.2.2. The Rule of Law	183
6.2.3. Article 2, Article 19(1), and the <i>Portuguese Judges</i> case	184
6.2.4. The Rule of Law Crisis	187
6.2.5. The Commission's Framework to Strengthen the Rule of Law	189
6.2.6. The Role of the ECJ Under Article 258 TFEU	190
6.2.7. Article 7 TEU	192
6.2.8. The Rule of Law Conditionality Regulation	195
6.2.8.1. Conditions	196
6.2.8.2. Measures that May be Taken	199
6.2.8.3. Decision-Making	200
6.2.8.4. Conclusion	201
6.3. The General Principles of Law	201
6.3.1. Function and Historical Origins	201
6.3.2. Taxonomy of General Principles	203
6.3.2.1. Rule of Law Principles	204
6.3.2.2. Principles as a Form of Constitutional Identity (Systemic or Structural Principles)	205
6.3.2.3. Fundamental Maxims	205
6.3.2.4. Principles Versus Rights	206
6.4. Proportionality	206
6.4.1. Meaning and Function	206
6.4.2. The Three Tests of Proportionality	207
6.5. Legal Certainty	210
6.5.1. Retroactivity and Vested Rights	211
6.5.2. Legitimate Expectations	214
6.5.3. Revocation of Decisions	216

6.6. Equality	217
6.6.1. Equality as a General Principle	217
6.6.2. The Charter	221
6.7. Autonomy	221
6.8. Mutual Trust	226
6.9. Institutional Balance	233
Further Reading	236
7 FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS AND THE CHARTER OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	238
7.1. The Development of the EU Concept of Fundamental Rights	238
7.2. Fundamental Rights and Integration: From Convergence to Divergence	244
7.3. The Union's Enclosed Constitutional Space	248
7.4. Article 6 TEU	251
7.5. The European Convention on Human Rights	253
7.6. The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union	261
7.6.1. Introduction	261
7.6.2. Freedoms, Rights, and Principles	263
7.6.3. Scope of Application	264
7.6.3.1. EU Institutions and Bodies	265
7.6.3.2. National Measures	266
7.6.3.3. Horizontal Application	268
7.6.4. Limitations on Charter Rights	269
7.6.5. Relationship with the EU Treaties and the ECHR	271
7.6.6. Relationship with the National Constitutions	276
7.6.7. Evaluation	279
Further Reading	280
8 INTERNATIONAL AGREEMENTS CONCLUDED BY THE UNION	281
8.1. The External Relations of the Union	281
8.2. The EU and International Law	283
8.2.1. <i>Jus Cogens</i>	284
8.2.2. Customary International Law	284
8.2.3. Compatibility of International Agreements Concluded by the EU with International Law	285
8.2.3.1. Position of International Agreements Concluded by the EU in the Normative Hierarchy of EU Law	288
8.3. Types of Agreements	289
8.4. Union Competence to Conclude International Agreements	289
8.4.1. The Principle of Conferral	289
8.4.2. Primary Powers	290
8.4.3. Secondary Powers: The Court's Initiative	290
8.4.4. The Treaty of Lisbon	299
8.4.4.1. The Existence of Union Competence	299
8.4.4.2. The Nature of Union Competence	300
8.4.4.3. Conclusions	304

8.4.5. Treaty-Making Procedure	305
8.4.6. ECJ Opinions on Envisaged Treaties	309
8.5. Effect of International Agreements in EU Law	311
8.5.1. Introduction	311
8.5.2. When is an Agreement Binding on the Union?	312
8.5.3. Agreements Concluded by the Union Acting Alone	312
8.5.4. Mixed Agreements	313
8.5.5. Customary International Law	317
8.5.6. What Does Binding Effect Mean?	317
8.6. Investor-State Arbitration Clauses Included in Agreements with Third Countries	319
Further Reading	322
9 AGREEMENTS CONCLUDED BY THE MEMBER STATES	323
9.1. Introduction	323
9.2. Agreements Between Member States	324
9.2.1. Subsidiary Conventions	324
9.2.2. Treaties Among a Sub-Group of Member States	325
9.2.3. Intra-EU Bilateral Investment Treaties	328
9.2.4. Compatibility of <i>Inter Se</i> Agreements with EU Law	330
9.2.4.1. Pre-Accession Agreements Concluded Between Member States	331
9.2.4.2. Post-Accession Agreements Concluded Between Member States	332
9.3. Agreements Between Member States and Third Countries	332
9.3.1. Binding Effect on the Union	332
9.3.2. Compatibility with EU Law	334
9.3.2.1. Pre-Accession Agreements Concluded by the Member States	334
9.3.2.2. Post-Accession International Agreements Between Member States and Third Countries	339
Further Reading	340
10 HIERARCHY AND CONFLICT OF PRIMARY SOURCES	341
10.1. Introduction	341
10.2. The Relationship Between Treaty Provisions and the General Principles of Law	342
10.3. Hierarchy Within the Constitutive Treaties	344
Further Reading	347
11 THE COMPETENCE OF THE EUROPEAN UNION	348
11.1. Introduction	348
11.2. The Principle of Conferral	350
11.3. Types of Competence	350
11.3.1. Exclusive Competence	351
11.3.2. Shared Competence	353
11.3.3. Supporting Competence	355

11.4.	The Unwritten Competence Dynamic	356
11.5.	Implied Powers	361
11.6.	The Flexibility Clause: Article 352 TFEU	362
11.7.	Dormant Competence	366
11.8.	The Principle of Subsidiarity	367
11.9.	The Principle of Proportionality	368
11.10.	The Role of National Parliaments in Monitoring Compliance with Subsidiarity and Proportionality	370
11.11.	The National Identity Clause	373
11.12.	Differentiated Integration	376
	11.12.1. Opt-Outs, Special Arrangements, and Closer Cooperation	376
	11.12.2. Enhanced Cooperation	378
	11.12.3. Closer Cooperation Through Other Means	380
11.13.	Conclusion	381
	Further Reading	381
12	THE PRINCIPLE OF PRIMACY	382
12.1.	Introduction	382
12.2.	International Law Antecedents	382
12.3.	The Evolution of Primacy	385
12.4.	From Primacy to Effectiveness	390
12.5.	Legal Effects of Primacy	393
12.6.	The Duty of Cooperation or Solidarity	395
	Further Reading	396
13	DIRECT EFFECT	398
13.1.	The Seminal Judgment in <i>Van Gend en Loos</i>	398
13.2.	The Evolution of the Doctrine	400
13.3.	Horizontal Effect	402
13.4.	The Conditions of Direct Effect	404
	13.4.1. The Provision Must be Clear and Unambiguous	404
	13.4.2. The Provision Must be Unconditional	404
	13.4.3. The Operation of the Condition Must not be Dependent on Further Action Being Taken by Union or National Authorities	406
	13.4.4. Conclusions	406
13.5.	Regulations	407
13.6.	Directives	411
	13.6.1. The Introduction of Direct Effect	411
	13.6.2. The Importance of the Deadline	414
	13.6.3. Differences Between Directives and Regulations	415
	13.6.4. Vertical and Horizontal Direct Effect	417
	13.6.5. The Definition of the 'State'	419
	13.6.6. The Imposition of Collateral Obligations on Private Parties	423
	13.6.7. The <i>Marleasing</i> Principle and the Duty of Convergent Interpretation	427
	13.6.8. Obligations Imposed by Directives Before the Expiration of the Time Limit for Their Implementation	432

13.6.9. Inverse Direct Effect	433
13.6.10. State Liability for Non-Implementation	434
13.6.11. Directives Expressing Primary Law Obligations	434
13.7. Decisions	439
13.8. General Principles of Law	439
13.9. Agreements with Third Countries	440
13.9.1. General	440
13.9.2. GATT and WTO	441
13.9.3. Contrasting Approaches	445
Further Reading	447
14 THE NATIONAL REACTION	448
14.1. Introduction	448
14.2. The Conundrum of <i>Kompetenz-Kompetenz</i>	450
14.3. The Conflicts Landscape	452
14.4. Germany	453
14.5. Denmark	463
14.6. France	466
14.7. Poland	473
14.8. Conclusions	475
Further Reading	476
15 UNION ACTS	479
15.1. Types of EU Acts	479
15.2. Nominal Classification	480
15.2.1. Regulations	480
15.2.2. Directives	481
15.2.3. Decisions	483
15.2.4. Soft Law	483
15.2.5. Sui-Generis or Atypical Acts	486
15.3. Legal Basis	487
15.4. Form	491
15.4.1. Preliminary Acts	491
15.4.2. Reasons	492
15.4.3. Signature	496
15.5. Publication, Notification, and Entry into Force	497
15.6. Legislative, Delegated, and Implementing Acts	498
15.6.1. Legislative Acts	498
15.6.2. Delegated and Implementing Acts	498
15.6.3. The Concept and Functions of Delegation	499
15.6.4. Delegation to the Commission: Article 290 TFEU	500
15.6.5. Delegation to EU Agencies	503
15.6.6. Delegation to Member States	504
15.6.7. Implementing Powers: Article 291 TFEU	505
15.6.8. Conclusions	506
Further Reading	506

PART IV JUDICIAL PROTECTION

Judicial Review of EU Acts	510
Control of Compatibility of Acts of the Member States with EU Law	510
Further Reading	511
16 REVIEWABLE ACTS	513
16.1. Introduction	513
16.2. The Requirement that the Act Must be Able to Produce Legal Effects	514
16.3. Preparatory Acts	517
16.4. Confirmatory Acts	520
16.5. Acts Producing Only Internal Effects	521
16.6. Self-Binding Acts	521
16.7. Soft Law Measures	524
16.8. International Agreements	526
16.9. Void and Voidable Acts	526
16.10. The Author of the Act	529
16.10.1. Entities Whose Acts are Subject to Challenge	529
16.10.2. Authority Uncertainty	532
16.10.3. National Acts	535
16.10.4. Composite Procedures	537
Further Reading	539
17 LOCUS STANDI	541
17.1. Privileged Applicants	541
17.2. Non-Privileged Applicants: Basic Requirements	542
17.3. Individual Concern	544
17.3.1. The <i>Plaumann</i> Test	544
17.3.2. Small Groups	546
17.3.3. Closed Group: Decisions	547
17.3.4. Closed Group: Regulations	549
17.3.5. Closed Group: The Current Position	551
17.3.6. Specific or Exclusive Rights	553
17.3.7. Union Law Requires Special Consideration to be Given to the Interests of the Applicant	554
17.3.8. Quasi-Judicial Determinations	554
17.3.8.1. Competition Proceedings	555
17.3.8.2. Anti-Dumping Proceedings	556
17.3.8.3. State Aid Proceedings	559
17.3.8.4. Conclusions	560
17.3.9. Pressure for Change	561
17.3.10. The Treaty of Lisbon	563
17.3.11. Individual Concern After the Treaty of Lisbon	564
17.3.12. Non-Commercial Interests	565
17.4. Direct Concern	566

17.5. Regulatory Acts that do not Entail Implementing Measures	574
17.5.1. The Meaning of Regulatory Act	574
17.5.2. The Condition that the Act must not Entail Any Implementing Measures	576
17.6. Non-EU States and International Actors	579
17.7. A Critique of the Case Law	581
17.8. Legal Interest in Bringing Proceedings	583
Further Reading	585
18 REVIEW, TIME LIMIT, AND ANNULMENT	587
18.1. Grounds of Review	587
18.1.1. Lack of Competence	588
18.1.2. Infringement of an Essential Procedural Requirement	589
18.1.3. Infringement of the Treaty or of Any Rule of Law Relating to its Application	592
18.1.4. Misuse of Powers	595
18.2. The Time Factor	597
18.3. The Standard of Judicial Scrutiny	599
18.3.1. The Different Standards of Review	599
18.3.2. Errors of Law, Fact, and Assessment	602
18.4. Time Limit	604
18.5. Annulment	605
18.5.1. Retroactivity	606
18.5.2. Compliance with the Judgment	608
18.5.3. Partial Annulment	610
18.6. Indirect Challenge	612
Further Reading	613
19 FAILURE TO ACT	615
19.1. Introduction	615
19.2. Negative Decisions	616
19.3. Definition of Position	618
19.4. Parties to the Proceedings	619
19.5. Reviewable Omissions	620
19.5.1. What is a Reviewable Omission?	620
19.5.2. Preliminary Acts	621
19.5.3. Failure to Repeal an Act	623
19.6. The Request for Action	626
19.6.1. General	626
19.6.2. Time Limit for Making Request	627
19.7. <i>Locus Standi</i>	629
19.8. Grounds of Review	632
19.8.1. Article 263 and Article 265 Compared	632
19.8.2. Duty to Act	633
19.8.3. Power to Act	634

19.9.	Form of Judgment	635
19.10.	Indirect Challenge	635
	Further Reading	636
20	INDIRECT CHALLENGE	637
20.1.	Introduction	637
20.2.	Treaty Provisions	638
20.3.	What Acts May be Challenged?	639
20.4.	Who May Make the Challenge?	645
20.5.	In What Proceedings May the Challenge Be Made?	646
20.6.	Grounds of Challenge	647
20.7.	The Effect of a Successful Challenge	648
20.8.	Non-Existent Acts	649
	Further Reading	649
21	UNION OBLIGATIONS	650
21.1.	Contract	650
21.1.1.	Jurisdiction of the CJEU	650
21.1.2.	Choice of Law	652
21.1.3.	The Contractual Nature of the Claim	653
21.2.	Restitution	655
21.2.1.	Introduction	655
21.2.2.	Substantive Law	656
21.2.3.	Jurisdiction	657
21.3.	Tort	658
21.3.1.	Introduction	658
21.3.2.	The Conditions of Liability	661
21.3.2.1.	Acts Imputable to the Union	661
21.3.2.1.1.	The Concept of Act	661
21.3.2.1.2.	Imputability	664
21.3.2.1.3.	Personal Acts	666
21.3.2.1.4.	Acts of Bodies to Which Powers Have Been Delegated	667
21.3.2.2.	The Requirement That the Act Must Be Unlawful	669
21.3.2.2.1.	From <i>Schöppenstedt</i> to <i>Bergaderm</i>	669
21.3.2.2.2.	The Requirement That the Rule Breached Must Be Intended to Confer Rights on Individuals	671
21.3.2.2.3.	The Requirement That the Breach Must Be Serious	675
21.3.2.2.4.	Can There Be Liability Without Breach?	686
21.3.2.3.	Damage	690
21.3.2.4.	Causation	693

21.3.3.	Concurrent and Joint Liability	698
21.3.3.1.	Attribution	698
21.3.3.2.	Exhaustion of National Remedies	700
21.3.3.2.1.	Restitution and Statutory Obligation-Based Claims	700
21.3.3.2.2.	Claims in Tort	702
21.3.3.3.	Conclusion	704
	Further Reading	704
22	ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS	706
22.1.	Introduction	706
22.2.	What Constitutes a Violation?	707
22.2.1.	Provisions Covered	707
22.2.2.	The Concept of State	710
22.2.3.	Violation by Private Parties	712
22.2.4.	Defences	713
22.3.	The Administrative Stage	715
22.3.1.	Introduction	715
22.3.2.	Commission Discretion	717
22.3.3.	Recording the Violation	719
22.3.4.	Time Limit for Commission Action	719
22.3.5.	Consequences of Procedural Defects	720
22.4.	The Judicial Stage	721
22.5.	Remedies Where the Commission Fails to Act	722
22.6.	Actions by Member States	724
22.7.	Interim Measures	726
22.8.	Effects of the Judgment	727
22.9.	Restitution and Damages	728
22.9.1.	State Aid	729
22.9.2.	Restitution Under Article 258 TFEU	730
22.10.	Consequences of Non-Compliance	732
22.11.	Fines	733
22.12.	Fines For Failure to Notify Transposition of Directives: Article 260(3)	735
22.13.	Conclusions	737
	Further Reading	739
23	PRELIMINARY REFERENCES	740
23.1.	Introduction	740
23.1.1.	Meaning Of 'Court'	741
23.1.2.	Entities Covered	742
23.1.3.	Issues Covered	742
23.2.	Which Provisions May Be Referred?	743
23.2.1.	The Treaties	743
23.2.2.	Agreements Between Member States	743
23.2.3.	Acts of the Representatives of the Member States	744
23.2.4.	Union Acts	744

23.2.5.	General Principles of Law	744
23.2.6.	Agreements with Non-Member States	745
23.2.7.	Acts of Institutions Established by Agreements with Non-Member States	750
23.2.8.	National Provisions Based on Union Law	750
23.3.	The Definition of a ‘Court or Tribunal’	752
23.3.1.	The Requirement That the Referring Body Must be a ‘Court or Tribunal’	753
23.3.1.1.	Conditions and Factors	753
23.3.1.2.	The Requirement of Independence	756
23.3.1.2.1.	The Importance of Judicial Independence in EU Law	756
23.3.1.2.2.	Administrative Bodies Acting in an Adjudicative Capacity	757
23.3.1.2.3.	The Requirement that the Referring Court or Tribunal Must Be Impartial and Independent	758
23.3.2.	The Requirement That the Referring Body Must Be a Court or Tribunal ‘Of A Member State’	760
23.4.	Power To Refer	762
23.5.	Obligation To Refer	763
23.6.	Control of Admissibility: Freedom to Refer and Docket Control	767
23.6.1.	Failure to Define Adequately the Legal and Factual Background to the Dispute	768
23.6.2.	Hypothetical Questions	769
23.6.3.	Contrived Proceedings	770
23.7.	When Should a Reference Be Made?	773
23.7.1.	Requisites For a Reference	773
23.7.2.	Discretion	775
23.7.3.	Circumstances in Which a National Court Covered by the Third Paragraph of Article 267 is not Under an Obligation to Make a Reference	776
23.7.3.1.	Exceptions	776
23.7.3.2.	The <i>Acte Clair</i> Doctrine	777
23.8.	Remedies For Failure To Refer	780
23.9.	Procedure	781
23.9.1.	The Reference	781
23.9.2.	Appeals Against an Order for Reference	782
23.9.3.	The Procedure Before the ECJ	783
23.9.4.	The Urgent Procedure	784
23.10.	Validity, Interpretation, and Application	785
23.10.1.	Preliminary Rulings on Validity	785
23.10.2.	Interpretation and Application of EU Law	787
23.11.	Effects of Preliminary Rulings	790
	Further Reading	792

25.4.2.	The <i>Miller No 1</i> case	852
25.4.3.	The Domestic Law Giving Effect to Withdrawal	857
25.4.3.1.	Retained EU Law	858
25.4.3.2.	Supremacy as a Principle of Domestic Law	859
25.4.3.3.	Abolition of Interpretative Obligation	859
25.4.3.4.	General Principles of Law, Fundamental Rights and the Charter	860
25.4.3.5.	The Status of Assimilated EU Law	860
25.4.3.6.	The Status of CJEU Case Law	860
25.4.3.6.1.	Post-Brexit Case Law	860
25.4.3.6.2.	Pre-Brexit Case Law	861
25.4.3.7.	Summary of Changes Made by the Retained EU Law (Revocation and Reform) Act 2023 (REULA)	862
25.5.	Conclusions	863
	Further Reading	864
	<i>Index</i>	865