

Justice in International Tax Law

A Normative Review of the International Tax Regime

Peter Hongler



Table of Contents

Preface		xix
Abbreviations		xxi
Part I		
Introduction and Methodology		
Chapter 1: Introduction		3
1.1.	International tax law at a crossroads	3
1.2.	Justice – Terminology and origin	5
1.3.	Justice as a domestic tax policy guideline	9
1.4.	Justice and the international tax regime – Some preliminary remarks	12
1.5.	Why is the international tax regime considered to be unjust?	14
Chapter 2: Structure and Methodology		21
2.1.	Why refer to political philosophy?	21
2.1.1.	Interdisciplinary research and legal studies	21
2.1.2.	Interdisciplinary research and international law	23
2.1.3.	Interdisciplinary research and international tax law	26
2.1.4.	Can lawyers influence political philosophy?	29
2.1.5.	Realizing a realistic utopia	31
2.1.6.	Limits of the reference to political philosophy	33
2.2.	Structure	35
2.2.1.	Part I	35
2.2.2.	Part II	36
2.2.3.	Part III	39
2.2.4.	Part IV	40

Part II
The International Tax Regime

The International Tax Regime – Scope of Research		45
Chapter 3: The Theories and Development of International Law		47
3.1. Overview		47
3.2. The term “sources”		48
3.2.1. General remarks		48
3.2.2. Article 38(1) ICJ Statute		49
3.2.3. Article 38(2) ICJ Statute and beyond		50
3.3. Naturalism and positivism		51
3.4. The historical development of the current world order		56
Chapter 4: The International Tax Regime		61
4.1. Sovereignty and jurisdiction – Key elements of the international tax regime		61
4.1.1. State sovereignty		61
4.1.1.1. Overview		61
4.1.1.2. The term “sovereignty” – Origin as a legal concept		62
4.1.1.3. Legal content		64
4.1.1.3.1. Internal sovereignty		65
4.1.1.3.2. External sovereignty		68
4.1.2. Fiscal sovereignty		71
4.1.2.1. Setting the framework		71
4.1.2.2. Genuine link doctrine		74
4.1.2.2.1. Preliminary remarks		74
4.1.2.2.2. The meaning of “genuine link” from an international law perspective		75
4.1.2.2.3. The meaning of “genuine link” from an international tax law perspective		77
4.1.2.2.4. Individuals: Citizenship as a sufficient genuine link		81
4.1.2.2.5. Corporations: Control of a foreign company as a sufficient link		83

4.1.2.3.	Worldwide and territorial taxation or source vs residence	87
4.1.2.3.1.	Preliminary remarks	87
4.1.2.3.2.	Taxation of residents and citizens	87
4.1.2.3.3.	Taxation of non-residents	89
4.1.2.3.4.	Source vs residence from a general international law perspective	90
4.1.2.4.	Income allocation and fiscal jurisdiction	93
4.1.2.5.	Transfer of fiscal competences	94
4.1.3.	Justice and the principle of sovereignty – Some concluding remarks	95
4.2.	Treaty-based rules of the international tax regime	96
4.2.1.	What is an international treaty?	96
4.2.1.1.	Preliminary remarks	96
4.2.1.2.	Binding obligation	97
4.2.1.2.1.	In general	97
4.2.1.2.2.	Some examples from a tax perspective	98
4.2.1.2.3.	Unilateral statements	102
4.2.1.3.	Between bodies of international law	104
4.2.1.4.	Governed by international law	106
4.2.1.5.	The validity of treaties	106
4.2.1.5.1.	Overview	106
4.2.1.5.2.	Coercion and invalidity	107
4.2.2.	Tax rules in international treaties – A “ <i>tour d’horizon</i> ”	109
4.2.3.	A closer look at double tax conventions	114
4.2.3.1.	Preliminary remarks	114
4.2.3.2.	Historical background	116
4.2.3.2.1.	International tax law until 1920	116
4.2.3.2.2.	The work of the League of Nations (1920-1945)	117
4.2.3.2.3.	The work of the UN (1946-)	119
4.2.3.2.4.	The work of the OECD/OEEC (1956-2012)	120
4.2.3.2.5.	The work of the OECD/G20 in the years 2012 and afterwards	122
4.2.3.2.6.	Implications for a normative review?	125
4.2.3.3.	Content of double tax conventions	126
4.2.3.3.1.	Some preliminary methodological remarks	126
4.2.3.3.2.	General rules (scope of convention and definitions)	126
4.2.3.3.3.	Allocation rules and method articles	127
4.2.3.3.4.	Transfer pricing	128
4.2.3.3.5.	Special provisions	130

Table of Contents

4.2.3.3.6.	Final provisions	130
4.2.4.	Enhanced multilateralism?	131
4.2.4.1.	Preliminary remarks	131
4.2.4.2.	Some existing multilateral tax agreements	133
4.2.5.	Justice and international treaties – Some concluding remarks	135
4.3.	Non-treaty-based rules and principles	139
4.3.1.	Preliminary remark	139
4.3.2.	Customary law	139
4.3.2.1.	Preliminary remarks	139
4.3.2.2.	The concept of customary international law	141
4.3.2.2.1.	Some preliminary remarks	141
4.3.2.2.2.	Voluntarism or positivism	142
4.3.2.2.3.	Good faith, reasonable expectations or trust in a certain behavior	143
4.3.2.2.4.	Morality or ethical values	145
4.3.2.3.	State practice	147
4.3.2.3.1.	What is state practice?	147
4.3.2.3.2.	Resolutions of international organizations	149
4.3.2.3.3.	Treaty provisions	151
4.3.2.4.	<i>Opinio iuris</i>	151
4.3.2.4.1.	Some general remarks	151
4.3.2.4.2.	Resolutions of international organizations as a sign of an <i>opinio iuris</i>	154
4.3.2.4.3.	The importance of treaty provisions	156
4.3.2.5.	Persistent objector	159
4.3.2.6.	Limitation of customary international tax law	160
4.3.2.7.	Intermediate observations from a tax perspective	164
4.3.2.8.	Examples from a tax perspective	165
4.3.2.8.1.	Preliminary remarks	165
4.3.2.8.2.	Excursus: Prohibition of extraterritorial taxation and CFC legislation	166
4.3.2.8.3.	Prohibition of juridical double taxation	168
4.3.2.8.3.1.	Preliminary remarks – Description of the rule	168
4.3.2.8.3.2.	State practice	169
4.3.2.8.3.3.	<i>Opinio iuris</i>	170
4.3.2.8.3.4.	Conclusion	171
4.3.2.8.4.	Non-taxation of diplomatic and consular personnel in the residence state	171
4.3.2.8.4.1.	Preliminary remarks – Description of the rule	171
4.3.2.8.4.2.	State practice	172

4.3.2.8.4.3. <i>Opinio iuris</i>	173
4.3.2.8.4.4. Conclusion	174
4.3.2.8.5. Arm's length principle	175
4.3.2.8.5.1. Preliminary remarks – Description of the rule	175
4.3.2.8.5.2. State practice	176
4.3.2.8.5.3. <i>Opinio iuris</i>	178
4.3.2.8.5.4. Conclusion	180
4.3.2.8.6. The “no harm” principle	181
4.3.2.8.6.1. Preliminary remarks	181
4.3.2.8.6.2. From an international law perspective	181
4.3.2.8.6.3. From an international tax law perspective	183
4.3.2.8.7. Interpretation principles according to article 31 VCLT	186
4.3.2.8.8. Fiscal transparency	187
4.3.2.9. Justice and customary international tax law – Some concluding remarks	188
4.3.3. General principles of international law	189
4.3.3.1. General remarks	189
4.3.3.2. Concepts of international law and general principles of law	191
4.3.3.3. Examples from a tax perspective	194
4.3.3.3.1. Preliminary remarks	194
4.3.3.3.2. Abuse of law	195
4.3.3.3.2.1. From an international law perspective	195
4.3.3.3.2.2. From an international tax law perspective	197
4.3.3.3.3. Estoppel	202
4.3.3.3.3.1. From an international law perspective	202
4.3.3.3.3.2. From an international tax law perspective	204
4.3.3.3.4. Collision rules	206
4.3.3.3.4.1. From an international law perspective	206
4.3.3.3.4.2. From an international tax law perspective	207
4.3.3.3.5. Statute of limitation or extinctive prescription	208
4.3.3.3.5.1. From an international law perspective	208
4.3.3.3.5.2. From an international tax law perspective	210
4.3.3.3.6. Excursus: <i>Pacta sunt servanda</i>	210
4.3.3.4. Justice and general principles of law – Some concluding remarks	212
4.3.4. Soft law	214
4.3.4.1. Definition of international soft (tax) law	214
4.3.4.2. International organizations as quasi-legislative bodies	216
4.3.4.3. The UN as a body of international tax law legislation	218

Table of Contents

4.3.4.3.1.	In general	218
4.3.4.3.2.	The Committee of Experts on International Cooperation in Tax Matters	220
4.3.4.3.3.	The publications of the Committee of Experts on International Cooperation in Tax Matters and their impact	221
4.3.4.3.4.	UN Conferences on Financing for Development	222
4.3.4.3.4.1.	Introduction	222
4.3.4.3.4.2.	Monterrey Consensus	223
4.3.4.3.4.3.	The Doha Declaration	224
4.3.4.3.4.4.	Addis Ababa Action Agenda	225
4.3.4.3.4.5.	The Addis Tax Initiative	227
4.3.4.3.4.6.	Intermediate conclusions	230
4.3.4.4.	The OECD as a body of international tax law legislation	231
4.3.4.4.1.	In general	231
4.3.4.4.2.	The CFA	232
4.3.4.4.3.	The publications of the OECD in tax matters and their impact	234
4.3.4.5.	What are the reasons for an enhanced use of soft law?	236
4.3.4.6.	Soft law and its effectiveness	238
4.3.4.7.	Justice and soft law – Some concluding remarks	240
4.3.5.	Judicial decisions and legal writing	242
4.3.6.	Equity	243
4.4.	The international tax regime and its constitutional content	244
4.4.1.	Some preliminary methodological remarks	244
4.4.2.	What is the purpose of a constitution?	249
4.4.3.	Constitutionalism in international law	251
4.4.3.1.	Organizational rules	251
4.4.3.1.1.	Legislative, judicial and executive bodies	251
4.4.3.1.2.	Other organizational rules and principles	253
4.4.3.2.	Substantive rules and principles	255
4.4.3.2.1.	Some general remarks	255
4.4.3.2.2.	Protection of individual rights	256
4.4.3.2.3.	Protection of community interest	257
4.4.4.	Constitutionalism in international tax law	260
4.4.4.1.	Organizational rules and principles	260
4.4.4.1.1.	Legislative, judicial and executive bodies	260
4.4.4.1.2.	Other organizational rules and principles	263

4.4.4.2.	Substantive rules and principles	264
4.4.4.2.1.	Protection of individual rights	264
4.4.4.2.2.	Protection of community interests	265
4.4.5.	Conclusion	269
Chapter 5:	Conclusions: The International Tax Regime – A Primitive Legal Regime	271
5.1.	General remarks on primitiveness	271
5.2.	Blurred jurisdiction-to-tax and its detrimental impact	272
5.3.	Bilateralism, “fuzzy multilateralism” and primitive international tax legislation	274
5.4.	The (biased) protection of community interests and individual rights	277
5.5.	The primitiveness of the traditional sources of international law	279
Part III		
Political Philosophy as a Normative Reference Point		
Introduction		285
Chapter 6:	John Rawls’ Ideal Theory of Inter-State Justice	287
6.1.	Why John Rawls as a starting point?	287
6.2.	A theory of justice as fairness	288
6.2.1.	Some conceptual remarks	288
6.2.2.	Rawls’ original position and the veil of ignorance	290
6.2.3.	The two principles of justice	291
6.3.	<i>The Law of Peoples</i>	294
6.3.1.	Some introductory remarks	294
6.3.2.	The second original position	296
6.3.3.	The principles of justice	298

Table of Contents

6.3.3.1.	Some preliminary remarks	298
6.3.3.2.	Principle of freedom, independence and <i>pacta sunt servanda</i>	300
6.3.3.3.	Peoples are to honor human rights	301
6.3.3.4.	Duty of assistance	302
6.3.4.	Rawls on international institutions and international cooperation	303
6.3.5.	No distributive duties at an international level	304
Chapter 7:	Reception of Rawls among Political Philosophers	307
7.1.	Preliminary remarks	307
7.2.	Missing out on individualism	308
7.3.	Missing out on international distributive justice	309
7.4.	Right institutionalists	310
7.4.1.	Nagel	310
7.4.2.	Blake	313
7.4.3.	Risse	316
7.5.	Left institutionalists	317
7.5.1.	Beitz	317
7.5.2.	Pogge	321
7.6.	Pure egalitarianism	324
7.6.1.	Caney	324
7.7.	The idea of justice of Amartya Sen	326
7.7.1.	Preliminary remarks	326
7.7.2.	The disadvantages of transcendental (ideal) theories	327
7.7.2.1.	Overview	327
7.7.2.2.	Ideal theories as necessary comparisons	329
7.7.3.	Reasoning	331
7.7.4.	Impartiality	333
7.7.5.	Is Sen sufficiently detailed to use his theory in the present study?	335
7.7.6.	How to assess injustice according to Sen	336
7.7.6.1.	Capabilities as a factor to measure inequality	336
7.7.6.2.	Excursus: Martha Nussbaum on global justice	337
7.7.6.3.	Intermediate conclusion	341

Chapter 8:	Essential Conclusions	343
8.1.	Transcendental and non-transcendental theories as non-exclusive guidelines	343
8.2.	Normative reasoning and impartiality	345
8.3.	International distributive justice – Assessment	346
8.3.1.	No global difference principle	347
8.3.2.	A continuous approach	349
8.3.3.	How to understand humanitarian duty	352
8.4.	The principles of sovereignty and fiscal self-determination – Assessment	354
8.4.1.	Justifications for the protection of sovereignty	354
8.4.2.	What elements of sovereignty should be protected?	356
8.4.3.	Our understanding of fiscal self-determination	359
8.4.4.	Relation of our understanding of fiscal self-determination and tax competition	362
8.4.5.	Intermediate conclusion	366
Part IV		
Normative Review of the International Tax Regime		
Preliminary Remarks		369
Chapter 9:	Distributive Duties and International Tax Law – Some Preliminary Thoughts	371
9.1.	Overview	371
9.2.	Is tax law the right instrument to achieve global distributive justice?	371
Chapter 10:	Reception of Theories of Political Philosophy in International Tax Law	377
10.1.	General remarks	377
10.2.	Benshalom’s relational duties	378
10.3.	Valta’s justification-to-tax theory	379

Chapter 11:	Review of Fundamental Principles of International Taxation	383
11.1.	Preliminary remarks	383
11.1.1.	Distinction between principles and rules	383
11.1.2.	Selection of rules and principles	384
11.2.	Principle 1: The ability-to-pay principle	387
11.2.1.	The ability-to-pay principle – An overview	387
11.2.2.	The ability-to-pay principle and its application at an international level	389
11.2.3.	Normative review	393
11.2.3.1.	Setting the question	393
11.2.3.2.	The underlying philosophical concepts	394
11.2.3.2.1.	Existing ideal theories	394
11.2.3.2.2.	Our position	396
11.2.3.2.3.	Reception in case law	396
11.2.3.3.	Practical constraints	399
11.2.3.3.1.	Cosmopolitan understanding	399
11.2.3.3.2.	Our understanding	401
11.2.3.3.3.	Intermediate conclusion	403
11.2.3.4.	No global single taxation principle	403
11.2.4.	Intermediate conclusion	405
11.3.	Principle 2: Inter-nation equity	407
11.3.1.	Inter-nation equity – An overview	407
11.3.2.	Normative review	410
11.3.2.1.	Methodological remarks	410
11.3.2.2.	Why should there be equity between states?	411
11.3.2.3.	Some further thoughts on income allocation and inter-nation equity	413
11.3.3.	Intermediate conclusion	416
11.4.	Principle 3: Efficiency and neutrality	416
11.4.1.	Efficiency and neutrality – An overview	416
11.4.2.	The never-ending fight for tax neutrality	418
11.4.3.	Normative review	421
11.4.3.1.	Preliminary remarks	421
11.4.3.2.	Worldwide welfare as the underlying reason for neutrality?	422
11.4.3.2.1.	Setting the framework	422
11.4.3.2.2.	Welfare impact of domestic policy	425

11.4.3.2.3.	Traditional welfare economics and utilitarian bias	429
11.4.3.2.4.	Missing distributive mechanisms	431
11.4.3.3.	Equality as a justification for neutrality	432
11.4.4.	Intermediate conclusion	434
11.5.	Principle 4: Source principle	436
11.5.1.	The source principle – An overview	436
11.5.2.	Normative review	439
11.5.2.1.	What are the underlying reasons for an application of the source principle?	439
11.5.2.2.	Reference to further philosophical ideas	442
11.5.3.	Intermediate conclusion	446
11.6.	Principle 5: Benefit principle	447
11.6.1.	The benefit principle – An overview	447
11.6.2.	Normative review	448
11.6.2.1.	Setting the question	448
11.6.2.2.	Benefit principle as an allocation principle	449
11.6.2.3.	Benefit principle as a justification-to-tax principle?	452
11.6.2.4.	Interaction with the source principle	454
11.6.3.	Intermediate conclusion	455
Chapter 12:	Review of Concrete Rules of the International Tax Regime	457
12.1.	Preliminary remarks	457
12.2.	Rule 1: Arm's length principle	457
12.2.1.	Preliminary remarks	457
12.2.2.	Normative review	458
12.2.2.1.	Arguments against and in favor of the arm's length principle	458
12.2.2.2.	Normative review of the existing debate	461
12.2.2.3.	Our position on the allocation of income	463
12.2.2.3.1.	Distributive duties and allocation of income	463
12.2.2.3.2.	Intermediate remarks	468
12.2.2.3.3.	Advantages of a (partly) destination-based allocation	469
12.2.3.	Intermediate conclusion	472

Table of Contents

12.3.	Rule 2: CFC rules	474
12.3.1.	Preliminary remarks	474
12.3.2.	Arguments in favor of and against strengthening CFC rules	475
12.3.3.	Normative review	476
12.3.3.1.	Preliminary remarks	476
12.3.3.2.	CFC rules and the principle of fiscal self-determination	477
12.3.3.2.1.	Concerns of fiscal self-determination	477
12.3.3.2.2.	Are CFC rules necessary to protect fiscal self-determination?	481
12.3.3.3.	Distributive duties	482
12.3.4.	Intermediate conclusion	485
12.4.	Rule 3: Mandatory arbitration	486
12.4.1.	Preliminary remarks	486
12.4.2.	Arguments in favor of and against mandatory arbitration	487
12.4.3.	Normative review	488
12.4.4.	Intermediate conclusion	490
12.5.	Rule 4: Treaty abuse	491
12.5.1.	Preliminary remarks	491
12.5.2.	Arguments in favor of and against the application of anti-abuse measures	492
12.5.3.	Normative review	493
12.5.3.1.	Preliminary remarks	493
12.5.3.2.	Unwritten anti-abuse rule	493
12.5.3.3.	Introduction of a PPT into double tax treaties	497
12.5.4.	Intermediate conclusion	498
12.6.	Rule 5: Fiscal transparency and economic sanctions	498
12.6.1.	Preliminary remarks	498
12.6.2.	Arguments in favor of and against international fiscal transparency	500
12.6.2.1.	The sovereignty debate	500
12.6.2.2.	Poor vs rich states	503
12.6.2.3.	The importance of reciprocity	505
12.6.2.4.	Further arguments to be considered	506
12.6.3.	Normative review	507
12.6.4.	Intermediate conclusion	511

Chapter 13:	Conclusions	513
13.1.	Preliminary remarks	513
13.2.	Interdisciplinary research and its success	513
13.3.	Global justice and international tax law – Some conceptual conclusions	516
13.4.	Enhanced tax cooperation and coercion and its consequences	519
13.5.	A new perspective on income allocation (source vs residence)	521
13.6.	The just double tax treaty	524
References		527
Peer Review Process and Statement by the Publisher		581