

EU Tax Law – Direct Taxation

2019 Edition

Marjaana Helminen



General Outline

Preface	xvii
Abbreviations and Terms	xix
Chapter 1 EU Tax Law as Part of the Legal System	1
1.1. Concepts	1
1.2. Relation to other legislation	3
1.3. Primary law	9
1.4. Secondary law	21
1.5. International conventions	27
1.6. Harmful tax competition and forbidden state aid	36
1.7. Elimination of international double taxation	46
1.8. Interpretation of EU law	55
Chapter 2 Non-Discrimination and Basic Freedoms	59
2.1. Discrimination based on nationality	59
2.2. Basic freedoms	68
2.3. Justifications for discrimination or restrictions	145
Chapter 3 Corporate Tax Directives	169
3.1. EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	169
3.2. EU Interest-Royalty Directive	197
3.3. EU Merger Directive	225
3.4. Anti-Tax Avoidance Directive	265
Chapter 4 EU Company Forms and the Future of Corporate Taxation	295
4.1. Introduction	295
4.2. European Company and European Cooperative Society	296
4.3. European Economic Interest Grouping	308
4.4. Future of corporate taxation in the European Union	310
Chapter 5 Transfer Pricing	319
5.1. Relevance	319
5.2. Code of Conduct on transfer pricing documentation	321
5.3. Advance pricing agreements	330
5.4. Arbitration Convention	341

Chapter 6 Mutual Assistance and Recovery of Tax Claims	369
6.1. Directive on Administrative Cooperation	369
6.2. Recovery Directive	408
Chapter 7 Legal Remedies	423
7.1. National legal remedies	423
7.2. Tax treaties	428
7.3. Dispute Resolution Mechanisms Directive	429
7.4. EU Court	453
7.5. Effects of EU Court judgments	462
References	467
Index	561

Table of Contents

Preface	xvii
Abbreviations and Terms	xix
Chapter 1 EU Tax Law as Part of the Legal System	1
1.1. Concepts	1
1.2. Relation to other legislation	3
1.2.1. Sovereignty and subsidiarity	3
1.2.2. Separateness and interaction	4
1.2.3. The primacy of EU law	5
1.2.4. The principle of the most lenient provision	6
1.2.5. Direct effect and application	8
1.3. Primary law	9
1.3.1. The founding treaties and the accession treaties	9
1.3.2. Fundamental rights	12
1.3.3. Legal principles of EU law	13
1.4. Secondary law	21
1.4.1. Concept	21
1.4.2. Directives	21
1.4.2.1. Authorization to issue directives	21
1.4.2.2. Impact of the directives	23
1.4.2.3. Directives on direct taxes	25
1.4.3. Recommendations and other measures	26
1.5. International conventions	27
1.5.1. Connection to EU law	27
1.5.2. Tax treaties between EU Member States	27
1.5.2.1. Right to conclude tax treaties	27
1.5.2.2. Primacy of EU law	29
1.5.2.3. Most favoured nation	30
1.5.3. Tax treaties with third countries	32
1.5.3.1. Right to conclude tax treaties	32
1.5.3.2. Primacy of EU law	33
1.5.4. Other treaties with non-Member States	34
1.5.4.1. EEA Agreement	34
1.5.4.2. Other conventions	35
1.6. Harmful tax competition and forbidden state aid	36
1.6.1. Harmful tax competition	36
1.6.1.1. Concept	36

Table of Contents

1.6.1.2.	Measures against harmful tax competition	37
1.6.1.3.	Prevention of tax evasion	38
1.6.2.	Prohibition of state aid	40
1.7.	Elimination of international double taxation	46
1.7.1.	Legal basis	46
1.7.2.	Tax treaties and directives	47
1.7.3.	Obligation to take into account taxes levied in another Member State	48
1.8.	Interpretation of EU law	55
1.8.1.	EU law method of interpretation	55
1.8.2.	EU law-consistent interpretation of domestic law	57
Chapter 2 Non-Discrimination and Basic Freedoms		59
2.1.	Discrimination based on nationality	59
2.1.1.	General conditions for application	59
2.1.2.	Concept of discrimination	61
2.1.3.	Comparable situation or different situation	64
2.1.3.1.	Comparability analysis	64
2.1.3.2.	Different situation	64
2.1.3.3.	Comparable situation	65
2.1.3.4.	Resident companies of different states	67
2.2.	Basic freedoms	68
2.2.1.	General conditions for application	68
2.2.2.	Free movement of goods	76
2.2.2.1.	Applicable norms	76
2.2.2.2.	Relevance to direct taxation	77
2.2.3.	Free movement of EU citizens	77
2.2.4.	Free movement of workers	80
2.2.4.1.	General conditions for application	80
2.2.4.2.	Different tax treatment on the basis of residence	82
2.2.4.2.1.	Employment in several states	82
2.2.4.2.2.	Most income from employment state	84
2.2.4.2.3.	Small part of income from employment state	87
2.2.4.3.	Social security contributions	89
2.2.5.	Freedom of establishment	92
2.2.5.1.	Relevance and scope of application	92
2.2.5.2.	Undertakings in a comparable situation	98
2.2.5.2.1.	Permanent establishments	98
2.2.5.2.2.	No permanent establishment	102

2.2.5.3.	Dividend taxation systems	103
2.2.5.3.1.	Permanent establishment	103
2.2.5.3.2.	Foreign-source dividends	103
2.2.5.3.3.	Non-resident dividend recipient	107
2.2.5.3.4.	Thin capitalization and interest deduction limitations	111
2.2.5.4.	Group taxation systems	113
2.2.5.4.1.	Need for cross-border balancing of profits and losses	113
2.2.5.4.2.	Permanent establishments	115
2.2.5.4.3.	No permanent establishment	117
2.2.6.	Free movement of capital and payments	122
2.2.6.1.	Primary rule	122
2.2.6.2.	Exceptions	126
2.2.6.3.	Relations to non-Member States	127
2.2.6.4.	Right to capital in companies	132
2.2.7.	Freedom to provide services	132
2.2.7.1.	Scope of application	132
2.2.7.2.	Cases on direct taxes	135
2.2.8.	Overlapping scope of application	137
2.2.8.1.	Freedom of establishment or free movement of capital?	137
2.2.8.2.	Free movement of capital or services?	142
2.2.8.3.	Freedom of establishment/free movement of capital or free movement of workers?	143
2.2.8.4.	Free movement of capital or goods?	144
2.2.8.5.	Simultaneous application	144
2.3.	Justifications for discrimination or restrictions	145
2.3.1.	Rule of reason	145
2.3.2.	Effectiveness of fiscal supervision and the recovery of tax debt	148
2.3.3.	Anti-avoidance purpose	149
2.3.3.1.	Tax planning versus tax avoidance	149
2.3.3.2.	CFC regimes as an example	154
2.3.4.	Balanced allocation of taxing rights	157
2.3.5.	Coherence of the national tax system	160
2.3.6.	Territoriality	163
2.3.7.	Need to prevent double use of losses	165
2.3.8.	Treatment in the other state	165
2.3.9.	Non-EU and non-EEA States	166

Chapter 3	Corporate Tax Directives	169
3.1.	EU Parent-Subsidiary Directive	169
3.1.1.	Background	169
3.1.2.	Scope of application	170
3.1.2.1.	Profit distributions between subsidiary and parent companies residing in different Member States	170
3.1.2.2.	Profit distributions connected with a permanent establishment	172
3.1.2.3.	Company of a Member State	176
3.1.2.4.	Permanent establishment	179
3.1.2.5.	Parent and subsidiary company	180
3.1.2.6.	Profit distribution	182
3.1.2.7.	Other requirements	183
3.1.2.8.	EEA and other non-Member States	184
3.1.3.	Tax treatment	184
3.1.3.1.	Tax treatment in the dividend recipient's state	184
3.1.3.1.1.	Elimination of double taxation in the parent company state	184
3.1.3.1.2.	Exemption or credit in the parent company state or in the permanent establishment state	185
3.1.3.1.3.	Treatment of hybrid subsidiaries in the parent company state	188
3.1.3.1.4.	Treatment of subsidiary-related costs in the parent company state	190
3.1.3.2.	Tax treatment in the subsidiary state	191
3.1.3.2.1.	No withholding tax	191
3.1.3.2.2.	Withholding tax	192
3.1.4.	Tax-avoidance situations	193
3.2.	EU Interest-Royalty Directive	197
3.2.1.	Background and force	197
3.2.2.	Tax treatment	198
3.2.2.1.	Tax consequences	198
3.2.2.2.	Administrative prerequisites	200
3.2.2.3.	Repayment of a tax levied in conflict with the directive	202
3.2.3.	Intra-EU cross-border payment	202

3.2.4.	Qualifying companies	209
3.2.4.1.	Company of a Member State	209
3.2.4.2.	Permanent establishment	213
3.2.4.3.	Associated companies	214
3.2.4.4.	Beneficial owner	217
3.2.5.	Source state	219
3.2.6.	The concepts of interest and royalty	221
3.2.6.1.	Interest	221
3.2.6.2.	Royalty	221
3.2.6.3.	Payments outside the scope of the directive	222
3.2.7.	Tax-avoidance situations	223
3.3.	EU Merger Directive	225
3.3.1.	Background and force	225
3.3.1.1.	Force	225
3.3.1.2.	Relevance of the directive	226
3.3.2.	Scope of application	227
3.3.2.1.	Reorganizations covered	227
3.3.2.2.	Company from a Member State	228
3.3.2.3.	Merger	231
3.3.2.4.	Division	236
3.3.2.5.	Transfer of assets	240
3.3.2.6.	Exchange of shares	242
3.3.3.	Tax treatment of mergers, divisions and transfers of assets	245
3.3.3.1.	Applicable provisions	245
3.3.3.2.	Deferral of capital gains taxation	246
3.3.3.3.	Carry-over of provisions and reserves	249
3.3.3.4.	Takeover of losses	249
3.3.3.5.	Holdings of the receiving company in the transferring company	251
3.3.3.6.	Tax exemption of the shareholders	251
3.3.3.6.1.	Situations covered	251
3.3.3.6.2.	Situations not covered by the tax exemption	253
3.3.3.7.	Transfer of a permanent establishment	254
3.3.4.	Transfer of registered office of a European Company or European Cooperative Society	256
3.3.4.1.	Background and relevance	256
3.3.4.2.	Transfer of registered office	256
3.3.4.3.	Tax consequences	257
3.3.5.	Tax avoidance	259

Table of Contents

3.3.5.1.	Artificial tax-avoidance arrangements	259
3.3.5.2.	Other situations	263
3.3.6.	Employee representation	264
3.4.	Anti-Tax Avoidance Directive	265
3.4.1.	Background, relevance and implementation	265
3.4.2.	Personal scope of the directive	266
3.4.3.	Interest deduction limitation rule	266
3.4.3.1.	Different limitations on interest deductions	266
3.4.3.2.	EBITDA-based fixed ratio rule	267
3.4.3.3.	Voluntary <i>de minimis</i> rule	269
3.4.3.4.	Voluntary exclusions	269
3.4.3.5.	Voluntary group ratio rule	272
3.4.3.6.	Voluntary carry-forward and carry-back	273
3.4.4.	Exit taxation provision	273
3.4.4.1.	Exit taxation	273
3.4.4.2.	Transfers covered	274
3.4.4.3.	Exclusion of temporal transfers	275
3.4.4.4.	Deferral of payment	276
3.4.4.5.	Tax value in the receiving country	277
3.4.4.6.	Estonia	278
3.4.5.	General anti-abuse rule	278
3.4.6.	Controlled foreign company rule	280
3.4.6.1.	Functioning and structure of the rule	280
3.4.6.2.	Entities treated as CFCs	280
3.4.6.3.	The CFC tax base	282
3.4.6.4.	Computation of the CFC income	284
3.4.7.	Hybrid mismatch rule	286
Chapter 4 EU Company Forms and the Future of Corporate Taxation		295
4.1.	Introduction	295
4.2.	European Company and European Cooperative Society	296
4.2.1.	Formation	296
4.2.1.1.	Company law	296
4.2.1.2.	Tax treatment	298
4.2.2.	Tax treatment of a European Company or a European Cooperative Society	303
4.2.2.1.	Relevance of the SE Regulation and the SCE Regulation	303
4.2.2.2.	National tax laws	304
4.2.2.3.	Tax treaties	305

4.2.2.4.	Founding treaties and directives	307
4.2.2.5.	Tax-related problems	308
4.3.	European Economic Interest Grouping	308
4.3.1.	Company law	308
4.3.2.	Tax treatment	309
4.4.	Future of corporate taxation in the European Union	310
4.4.1.	Need for development	310
4.4.2.	CCCTB	311
4.4.3.	Alternatives	314
4.4.4.	Significant digital presence and digital services tax	315
 Chapter 5 Transfer Pricing		 319
5.1.	Relevance	319
5.2.	Code of Conduct on transfer pricing documentation	321
5.2.1.	Background and purpose	321
5.2.2.	General principles	323
5.2.2.1.	Rights and obligations of enterprises	323
5.2.2.2.	Rights and obligations of Member States	325
5.2.3.	Content of documentation	326
5.2.3.1.	General principles	326
5.2.3.2.	Master file	328
5.2.3.3.	Country-specific documentation	329
5.3.	Advance pricing agreements	330
5.3.1.	Background and purpose	330
5.3.2.	Binding effect	331
5.3.3.	Prerequisites for an advance pricing agreement	332
5.3.4.	Conduct of the advance pricing agreement process	333
5.3.4.1.	Preliminary negotiations and informal application	333
5.3.4.2.	Formal application	334
5.3.4.3.	Evaluation and negotiations	337
5.3.4.4.	Formal advance pricing agreement	339
5.4.	Arbitration Convention	341
5.4.1.	Relevance, force and interpretation	341
5.4.1.1.	Relevance	341
5.4.1.2.	Force	342
5.4.1.3.	Interpretation	343
5.4.2.	Scope of application	344
5.4.2.1.	Elimination of double taxation	344
5.4.2.2.	Double taxation caused by a transfer pricing adjustment	345
5.4.2.3.	Enterprise of a contracting state	346

Table of Contents

5.4.2.4.	Serious penalty	348
5.4.2.5.	Taxes covered by the Arbitration Convention	348
5.4.2.6.	Competent authority	349
5.4.2.7.	Territorial scope of application	349
5.4.3.	Arm's length principle and transfer pricing adjustment	349
5.4.4.	Notification of a transfer pricing adjustment	351
5.4.5.	Mutual agreement procedure	352
5.4.5.1.	Institution of proceedings	352
5.4.5.2.	Notifications and information request	353
5.4.5.3.	Starting the negotiations	353
5.4.5.4.	Negotiations	355
5.4.5.5.	Agreement and implementation	357
5.4.6.	Arbitration procedure	358
5.4.6.1.	Starting the procedure	358
5.4.6.2.	Advisory commission	360
5.4.6.3.	Rights and obligations within the arbitration procedure	363
5.4.6.4.	Opinion of the advisory commission	364
5.4.6.5.	Costs	365
5.4.7.	Correction of tax assessment	366
5.4.7.1.	Abolition of international double taxation	366
5.4.7.2.	Suspension of tax collection	367
Chapter 6	Mutual Assistance and Recovery of Tax Claims	369
6.1.	Directive on Administrative Cooperation	369
6.1.1.	Background and relevance	369
6.1.2.	Scope of application	372
6.1.3.	Types of information exchange	375
6.1.3.1.	Automatic exchange of information	375
6.1.3.2.	Automatic exchange of information on reportable cross-border arrangements	380
6.1.3.2.1.	Introduction	380
6.1.3.2.2.	Reportable cross-border arrangements	381
6.1.3.2.3.	Reporting obligation	387
6.1.3.2.4.	Automatic exchange of information	391
6.1.3.2.5.	Data protection and penalties	393
6.1.3.3.	Exchange on request	394

6.1.3.4.	Spontaneous exchange of information	397
6.1.3.5.	The exchanging authority	398
6.1.4.	Limits for exchange of information	400
6.1.5.	Disclosure of information	402
6.1.6.	Presence in the requested state	404
6.1.7.	Notification of tax decisions	405
6.1.8.	Simultaneous controls	406
6.1.9.	Consultations	407
6.2.	Recovery Directive	408
6.2.1.	The norms and scope of application	408
6.2.1.1.	Norms	408
6.2.1.2.	Taxes on income and capital	409
6.2.2.	Competent authorities	409
6.2.3.	Types of assistance	410
6.2.3.1.	Exchange of information	410
6.2.3.2.	Notification of documents	411
6.2.3.3.	Recovery	412
6.2.3.4.	Precautionary measures	416
6.2.4.	Limits to the obligation to assist	417
6.2.5.	Periods of limitation	418
6.2.6.	Use of languages	419
6.2.7.	Disclosure of information and documents	420
6.2.8.	Costs linked to recovery	421
Chapter 7	Legal Remedies	423
7.1.	National legal remedies	423
7.2.	Tax treaties	428
7.2.1.	Mutual agreement procedure	428
7.2.2.	Arbitration Convention	429
7.3.	Dispute Resolution Mechanisms Directive	429
7.3.1.	Objective and scope	429
7.3.2.	Interpretation	431
7.3.3.	Complaint	431
7.3.4.	Mutual agreement procedure	436
7.3.5.	Dispute resolution by the advisory commission	437
7.3.6.	The alternative dispute resolution commission	443
7.3.7.	Procedural rules	444
7.3.8.	The opinion and the final decision on the dispute	447
7.3.9.	Interaction with national proceedings	449
7.3.10.	Special provisions for individuals and smaller undertakings	452

Table of Contents

7.4.	EU Court	453
7.4.1.	Tasks of the EU Court	453
7.4.2.	Preliminary rulings	455
7.4.3.	Actions	458
7.4.3.1.	Actions against a Member State	458
7.4.3.2.	Infringement procedure	459
7.4.3.3.	Actions of Member States	460
7.4.4.	Costs	461
7.5.	Effects of EU Court judgments	462
7.5.1.	Repayment of taxes paid in conflict with EU law	462
7.5.2.	Liability for damages	464
7.5.3.	Consequences of the failure to comply with an EU Court judgment	466
References		
	Bibliography	467
	EU Court cases	533
	European Court of Human Rights	546
	EFTA Court	547
	EU Court cases	547
	Index	561