

# **Conceptual Problems of the Corporate Tax**

Swiss-US Comparative Analysis

Giedre Lideikyte Huber



---

## Table of Contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b>		xiii
<b>Chapter 1: General Introduction</b>		1
1.1. General research framework		1
1.1.1. Scope and objectives		1
1.1.2. Comparative framework		3
1.1.3. Sources		5
1.2. Guiding legal principles of the Swiss tax system		7
1.2.1. Ability to pay and the distributive justice principles		7
1.2.2. Legality		9
1.2.3. Equivalence (benefit taxation)		11
1.2.4. Economic freedom		12
1.2.5. Cyclical taxation and the <i>Totalgewinn</i> theory		14
Part 1		
Formal Approach: Entity Classification Problem		
<b>Chapter 2: Opening Comments Part 1</b>		21
<b>Chapter 3: Swiss Entity Classification for Tax Purposes</b>		27
3.1. Relationship between tax law and private law		27
3.1.1. Historical approach		28
3.1.2. Contemporary approach		30
3.1.3. Excursus: Interaction in commercial and tax law reporting		32
3.1.3.1. Determinance principle		32
3.1.3.2. Exceptions to the determinance principle		34
3.1.4. Summary and evaluation		36
3.2. General entity classification rule: The separation principle		39
3.2.1. Legal framework		39
3.2.2. Definition of a legal entity		40
3.2.2.1. Domestic entities		40
3.2.2.1.1. General comments		41
3.2.2.1.2. Types of business corporations		44

## Table of Contents

---

3.2.2.2.	Foreign entities	48
3.2.2.2.1.	Private international law: The principle of incorporation (article 154 PILA)	48
3.2.2.2.2.	Tax law: The principle of resemblance (article 49(3) LIFD)	51
3.2.3.	Entities without legal personality ( <i>sociétés de personnes</i> )	53
3.2.3.1.	Civil law framework	53
3.2.3.1.1.	General comments	53
3.2.3.1.2.	Types of non-corporate businesses	54
3.2.3.1.3.	Sole proprietorships	55
3.2.3.1.4.	Partnerships	56
3.2.3.2.	Tax law framework	61
3.2.3.2.1.	Tax subjects and flow-through treatment	61
3.2.3.2.2.	Tax object	62
3.2.4.	Summary and critical review	64
3.3.	Exceptions to the separation principle	65
3.3.1.	“Substance over form” approach	65
3.3.1.1.	Absence of a general substance-over-form legal norm	65
3.3.1.2.	Specific substance-over-form legal tools	68
3.3.2.	Tax avoidance	73
3.3.2.1.	Abuse-of-a-right theory in private law (article 2(2) CC)	73
3.3.2.2.	Judicial theory of tax avoidance	75
3.3.2.2.1.	Concept and legal framework	75
3.3.2.2.2.	Doctrinal critics	78
3.3.2.3.	<i>Durchgriff</i> (piercing of the corporate veil)	80
3.3.2.3.1.	Concept and legal framework	80
3.3.2.3.2.	Private law	81
3.3.2.3.3.	Tax law	84
3.3.2.4.	Excursus: “Economic viewpoint” in tax law interpretation	90
3.3.3.	Normative approach	92
3.3.3.1.	Opening comments	92
3.3.3.2.	Collective investment schemes	93
3.3.3.2.1.	Definition and legal framework	93
3.3.3.2.2.	SICAVs	94
3.3.3.2.3.	Contractual funds investing directly in real estate	99
3.3.3.3.	Foreign pass-through entities	101

3.3.3.3.1.	Pass-through entities subject to Swiss limited taxing jurisdiction (articles 49(3) and 11 LIFD)	101
3.3.3.3.2.	Pass-through entities with no economic activities in Switzerland	108
3.3.3.3.3.	Critical evaluation of article 49(3) LIFD	111
3.3.3.4.	Entities with quasi-legal personality	113
3.3.4.	Summary and critical review	114
3.3.4.1.	Tax avoidance and <i>Durchgriff</i>	114
3.3.4.2.	Collective investment schemes	116
3.3.4.3.	Taxation of foreign pass-through entities	117
<b>Chapter 4:</b>	<b>US Entity Classification for Tax Purposes</b>	<b>119</b>
4.1.	US entity classification for tax purposes	119
4.1.1.	Opening comments	119
4.1.2.	Historical departure from commercial law	120
4.1.2.1.	Origins and the “resemblance test”	120
4.1.2.2.	Kintner regulations	122
4.1.3.	Current tax entity classification	124
4.1.3.1.	Three-step approach	124
4.1.3.2.	“Check-the-box” regulations	125
4.1.3.2.1.	Legal framework	125
4.1.3.2.2.	Criticism and the 2017 reform	127
4.1.3.3.	Corporations for tax purposes (“C corporations”)	128
4.1.3.4.	Flow-through entities for tax purposes	129
4.1.3.4.1.	Sole proprietorship	130
4.1.3.4.2.	Partnerships	130
4.1.3.4.3.	Hybrid entities	133
4.1.3.4.4.	S Corporations	135
4.1.3.5.	Classification of foreign entities	137
4.1.4.	Uncertainty in defining corporate residence for income tax purposes	139
4.2.	Anti-avoidance doctrines	141
4.2.1.	Choice-of-form problem	141
4.2.2.	Economic-substance doctrine	144
4.2.2.1.	Relationship with other anti-avoidance doctrines	144
4.2.2.2.	Legal framework	145
4.2.2.2.1.	Judicial development	145
4.2.2.2.2.	Codification	148
4.2.2.2.3.	Criticism	150
4.2.2.3.	Piercing the corporate veil with the “agent theory”	152

## Table of Contents

---

4.3.	Summary and critical review	154
4.3.1.	Tax law entity classification	154
4.3.2.	Tax avoidance doctrines	155
4.3.3.	Comparative critical review	156
4.3.3.1.	Entity classification	156
4.3.3.2.	Judicial tax avoidance theory	158
<b>Chapter 5:</b>	<b>Closing Comments on Part 1</b>	<b>161</b>
Part 2		
Substantial Approach: The Justification Problem		
<b>Chapter 6:</b>	<b>Economic Double Taxation and Its Role in Corporate Tax</b>	<b>165</b>
6.1.	The concept of economic double taxation in the corporate context	165
6.1.1.	Concept	165
6.1.1.1.	International, domestic and corporate double economic taxation	165
6.1.1.2.	“Classic” and “fictitious” economic double taxation	166
6.1.2.	Economic double taxation of corporate income in a cross-border context	170
6.1.3.	Taxation of business income in Switzerland	172
6.1.3.1.	Double economic taxation of corporate income	172
6.1.3.1.1.	Subjects liable to tax on business income	172
6.1.3.1.2.	Tax on the business income of an individual	173
6.1.3.1.3.	Tax on the profits of legal persons	174
6.1.3.2.	Current measures mitigating the effect of corporate economic double taxation in Switzerland	176
6.1.3.2.1.	Relief for qualifying dividends	177
6.1.3.2.2.	Capital gains exemption	179
6.1.3.2.3.	Special corporate profit tax regimes	181
6.1.3.2.4.	Deduction of interest on corporate debt	183
6.1.4.	Taxation of business income in the United States	186
6.1.4.1.	Double economic taxation of corporate income	186
6.1.4.1.1.	General remarks	186
6.1.4.1.2.	Corporate tax rate structure prior to 1 January 2018	188
6.1.4.1.3.	Corporate tax rates after 1 January 2018	191
6.1.4.2.	Measures mitigating economic double taxation	193
6.1.4.2.1.	Choice of a pass-through business entity	193

6.1.4.2.2.	Other principal measures mitigating economic double taxation	195
6.1.5.	Summary and critical review	196
6.2.	Historical development of corporate tax and economic double taxation	199
6.2.1.	Switzerland	200
6.2.1.1.	Emergence of corporate profit tax	200
6.2.1.2.	Early views on corporate tax and economic double taxation	205
6.2.1.3.	The extent of economic double taxation in Switzerland	208
6.2.1.3.1.	Economic double taxation considerations in corporate tax reforms	208
6.2.1.3.2.	Harmonization of cantonal taxes and the first company tax reform (CTR I)	208
6.2.1.3.3.	Second company tax reform (CTR II) and the ERU Report	212
6.2.1.4.	Current extent of the economic double taxation of corporations in comparison with pass-through entities	216
6.2.1.5.	Summary and critical review	219
6.2.2.	The United States	221
6.2.2.1.	Emergence of an entity-level tax in the United States	221
6.2.2.2.	Introduction of economic double taxation	223
6.2.3.	Summary and critical review	226
6.3.	Base erosion and the future of the “classical” system	227
<b>Chapter 7:</b>	<b>Ability to Pay in Corporate Taxation</b>	<b>231</b>
7.1.	Ability to pay of an individual: Fundamental concepts	231
7.1.1.	Emergence, concept and theoretical alternatives (benefits theory)	231
7.1.2.	Horizontal and vertical equity	235
7.1.2.1.	Concept and measures	235
7.1.2.2.	Marginal utility of income and social welfare function	237
7.1.2.3.	Consumption as a measure of ability to pay	239

## Table of Contents

---

7.1.3.	Ability to pay of an individual in Swiss law	240
7.1.3.1.	Normative framework	240
7.1.3.1.1.	Objectives and scope	240
7.1.3.1.2.	Horizontal and vertical equity	243
7.1.3.2.	Benefit taxation and the principle of equivalence	246
7.1.3.3.	Exceptions to the ability-to-pay principle:	
	Direct taxes pursuing non-fiscal objectives	248
7.1.3.3.1.	Taxes as incentives and policy instruments	248
7.1.3.3.2.	Taxes as incentives in Swiss law: Concept and goals	250
7.1.3.3.3.	Conditions	251
7.1.3.3.4.	Exceptions in corporate taxation	255
7.1.3.3.5.	Limits to the exceptions to the principle of the ability to pay (Obwalden case law)	258
7.1.4.	Summary and critical review	261
7.2.	Ability to pay of a legal entity?	263
7.2.1.	Swiss perspective	264
7.2.1.1.	Normative framework	264
7.2.1.1.1.	Legal basis	264
7.2.1.1.2.	Definition through the taxable base	265
7.2.1.1.3.	Horizontal and vertical equity in corporate taxation	267
7.2.2.	The US perspective	287
7.2.2.1.	Rejection of corporate ability to pay	288
7.2.2.2.	Economic incidence of corporate tax	291
7.2.2.2.1.	Background rationale	292
7.2.2.2.2.	Basic concepts of tax incidence	294
7.2.2.2.3.	Different theories on corporate tax incidence	296
7.2.2.2.4.	The Swiss perspective on the economic incidence of corporate tax	300
7.2.2.3.	Other theoretical arguments for corporate tax	303
7.2.2.3.1.	General criticism	303
7.2.2.3.2.	Limiting corporate power through taxation	305
7.2.3.	Summary and critical review	312
7.2.3.1.	Critical review of the Swiss normative framework	312
7.2.3.2.	Critical review of the Swiss theoretical debate	313
7.2.3.3.	The US perspective and the theory of economic tax incidence	317

<b>Chapter 8:</b>	<b>Conclusions</b>	321
8.1.	On the form	321
8.2.	On the substance	324
8.3.	Application of the results in this book to other legal systems and further research questions	328
<b>Bibliography</b>		333